

FRAMING AND SOCIAL MOVEMENTS:
A CASE STUDY ON THE RED SHIRT
MOVEMENT IN TAIWAN

by

WEN-HSIN HO

Presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School of
The University of Texas at Arlington in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements
for the Degree of

MASTER OF ARTS IN SOCIOLOGY

THE UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT ARLINGTON

AUGUST 2010

Copyright © by WEN-HSIN HO 2010

All Rights Reserved

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank many individuals who made this thesis possible. I would like to thank my family -- my parents, Jung-yi Ho and Hui-man Hung, and my brother, William Ho, for their care and support through all these years. I would like to thank my advisor Robert Kunovich for his commitment to this thesis, for the weekly meetings, for his insightful comments, and for his support and encouragement. I would like to thank Professor Jeff Tsay for his compassion and patience in continually guiding me to view this research with a neutral viewpoint. I would like to thank Professor John Moon for his patience and suggestions on the thesis. I would like to thank Professor Heather Jacobson for her instructions in methodology and her care. I also would like to thank Professor Raymond Eve for his great social movement class that inspired me to conduct this research.

I owe my deepest gratitude to Ming-pei Eades and Doris Ferguson, who spent countless hours in discussing this research with me, in editing the paper, and in caring for me. I am also grateful to Ashley Collins, Jayma Compton, Tamar Hall, Tina Lee, I-Chen and Michael Lei, Rebecca Lim, Tom Little, Grace Tan, Margaret Taylor, Emma Wang, Evelyn Wang, Emily Wilson, and many other friends for their unconditional love, care, and support

June 14, 2010

ABSTRACT

FRAMING AND SOCIAL MOVEMENTS: A CASE STUDY ON THE RED SHIRT MOVEMENT IN TAIWAN

Wen-hsin Ho, M.A.

The University of Texas at Arlington, 2010

Supervising Professor: Robert M. Kunovich

In my thesis, I use the social movement literature and framing theory to examine the rapid rise and fall of Taiwan's Red Shirt social movement in 2006. The movement was against President Chen Shui-bian, who was accused of corruption; its main goal was to oust President Chen from office. From its inception in August 2006 to its demise in October 2006, this social movement swelled to include several hundred thousand participants, but collapsed nearly as quickly as it rose to prominence. The Red Shirt movement and the surrounding events were extensively covered by television, print, and Internet media. Many scholars argue that the media plays an important role in the success and failure of social movement organizations. They often focus on the way in which media organizations describe social movements and their opponents (e.g., the grievances, legitimacy, etc.) and how this coverage influences the general public, participants, and opponents. Using this literature, I adopt content analysis to analyze sampled newspaper articles from the United Daily News (UDN) and the Liberty Times (LT) covering the Red Shirt movement. The study period – from August to November 2006 – is separated into five time periods based on the four highlighted movement activities, which

include the Nazca Line, Encircling the City, Blossom Everywhere, and the Besiege event. I compare the manifest and latent media frames, which include diagnostic frames, prognostic frames, motivational frames, political opportunity frames, culturally familiar symbols, and latent content, across newspapers and over time. In particular, I examine the convergence and fragmentation of the media frames and frames from the Red Shirt movement to see how these impact the rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement.

The results suggest that changes in media frames played a role in explaining the rise and fall of the Red Shirt social movement. Among the media frames, the political opportunity frames appear to have played the most important role in shaping the movement because these frames bring the real openings in the political system to the readers' attention, which encouraged the movement supporters to continually challenge the regime. The consistent report of the impeachment bill against President Chen Shui-bian and the support from the pan-Blue political leaders directly point to the success of the movement; in the end, the reported close of the political opportunities corresponds to the movement's fall. This result further indicates that, being in a politically polarized society, Taiwan's media has a great impact on its people.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
ABSTRACT	iv
LIST OF TABLES	ix
Chapter	Page
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
2. LITERATURE REVIEW	4
2.1 Frame and Framing.....	4
2.2 Media Frames and Media Framing	5
2.3 Media Discourse and Public Discourse	6
2.4 Mass Media and Social Movements	7
2.5 Framing Theory in Social Movements	8
2.5.1 Grievances Theory.....	8
2.5.2 Core Framing Tasks.....	8
2.5.3 Framing Political Opportunity	10
2.5.4 Counterframes	11
2.6 Summary.....	11
3. THE POLITICAL AND SOCIAL BACKGROUND OF TAIWAN.....	13
3.1 Political Climate.....	13
3.2 Mass Media	16
3.3 Chen Shui-bian and The Corrupt Allegations	18
3.4 Shi Ming-teh and The Red Shirt Movement.....	19
3.5 The Red Shirt Movement's Four Major Activities.....	21
3.6 Significance of The Red Shirt Movement.....	23

3.7 The Purpose of This Study.....	24
4. SOURCE OF DATA AND METHODOLOGY	25
4.1 Content Analysis	25
4.2 Data Description.....	26
4.3 Dates and Timeline	27
4.4 Sampling Procedure.....	28
4.5 Creation of Coding Sheet.....	29
4.6 Analysis	31
5. ANALYSIS.....	33
5.1 Cross-time Comparisons Within The UDN and LT	33
5.1.1 Analysis on UDN	33
5.1.2 Analysis on LT.....	36
5.2 Contrast Between The UDN and LT	38
6. CONCLUSION	42
6.1 Introduction.....	42
6.2 The Result.....	42
6.2.1 The Rapid Rise of The Red Shirt Movement	43
6.2.2 The Rapid Fall of The Red Shirt Movement.....	44
6.3 Implications for Social Movement Literature and Framing Theory	45
6.4 Conclusion.....	46
APPENDIX	
A. SHI MING-TEH'S LETTER TO PRESIDENT CHEN SHUI-BIAN.....	48
B. CODING SHEET.....	54
C. SUMMARIES OF THE NEWS ARTICLES	56
D. COMPARISONS BETWEEN THE UDN AND LT ARTICLES	79

REFERENCES.....	85
BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION	91

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
4.1 The Numbers of News Articles From Both Newspapers.....	29
5.1 Article Contrast Between UDN and LT.....	38

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Gitlin (1980), in his notable study *The Whole World Is Watching*, once said that the American society is saturated with mass media because of its pervasiveness and accessibility. The Taiwanese society is also permeated with mass media. In 2006, Taiwan had 63 cable television channels, 178 registered radio stations, 2,273 newspapers, and 5,349 magazines. In addition, 73.39 percent of the population has access to the internet and 100 percent to television. Some of the cable news channels broadcast twenty-four hours a day and seven days a week. However, although information is readily available, Gitlin (1980) argues that a discrepancy exists -- that is, there is a gap between fact and the processed truth conveyed by the mass media.

People perceive reality through the lens of mass media, which is often presented from the standpoint of actors with specific interests. The central organizing principle that media uses to construct reality or gives meaning to events is called a media frame (Gitlin 1980). When mass media uses frames to direct their readers or audiences to interpret events in certain ways, it is called media framing. Media framing is viewed as being successful if the readers and audiences pick up the conveyed frames and think in the same way as the information senders.

Because of the effectiveness of framing, media has become a very significant mobilizing tool for social movements (Gamson and Wolfsfeld 1993). A social movement considers a situation as problematic, gives suggestions to remedy that situation, and motivates people to take actions. In this process the proposed ideas are connected with the concepts existing in people's belief system. Additionally, a social movement identifies and informs people about the dysfunctions of the political system, which opens a window for challengers.

In this process, when there is a convergence of media and movement frames, mass media is able to align people's perceptions with that of the social movement, which is likely to result in the rise of a social movement. On the contrary, when a fragmentation of media frames and movement frames appears, it tends to lead to a fall of a social movement. In this study, I examine the rapid rise and fall of Taiwan's Red-Shirt movement from 2006. The Red-Shirt Movement was a protest against President Chen Shui-bian who was facing the allegations of embezzling state affair funds; its main goal was to oust President Chen from office. From its inception in August 2006 to its demise in November 2006, this social movement swelled to include several hundred thousand participants, but collapsed nearly as quickly as it rose to prominence. During this three month period, the "Depose Bian" movement, later coined by the mass media as the "Red-Shirt movement," and the surrounding events were extensively covered by television, print, and Internet media. This study examines whether the media framing brought people to participate in and also influenced them to leave the Red-Shirt Movement.

I use the social movement literature and framing theory to analyze the contents of newspaper articles; I examine the convergence and fragmentation of the media frames of the Red-Shirt movement. Guided by this literature, I develop a coding sheet to analyze a sample of front page articles from two newspapers, the United Daily News (UDN) and the Liberty Times (LT). Also, I use both quantitative and qualitative content analysis to analyze newspaper articles. For the quantitative approach, I record the number of converged frames over time. For the qualitative approach, I compare the frames contained in newspaper articles from the Red-Social movement, the government, and the newspapers, emphasizing trends in the media frames across the two newspapers and over five time periods, which are set off by key events during the life cycle of the movement.

This study provides an explanation for the quick rise and fall of the Red-Shirt movement. By analyzing the contents of newspaper articles, the result shows that the

convergence and divergence of the media and movement frames reflect the origin and decline of the Red-Shirt movement. The rise and fall of the Red-Shirt Movement provides a good example of how media framing influenced the people of Taiwan in their thoughts of and reactions to public events.

This thesis contains six chapters. In the second chapter, I review the social movement literature and framing theory and discuss how media discourse influences public discourse as well as how media framing influences the rise and fall of social movements. I use this review to identify media frames that may be relevant to Taiwan's Red Shirt movement. In the third chapter, I describe the social, political, and economic background of Taiwanese society. In particular, I describe the events surrounding the rapid rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement. I present my methodology in the fourth chapter; the method, the nature of the data, the sampling process, and how I carried out the analysis. I discuss the results in chapter five. Finally, the study ends with a discussion of the results and a conclusion in chapter six. I find that alternations of media frames appear to play a role on the rapid rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement. This result can be replicated and expanded in studies of other social movements.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

In this chapter, I provide an overview of the social movement literature. In the first section, I define and distinguish the concepts of frame and framing and then discuss the process, function, and results of framing. In the second section, I discuss the impacts of mass media and media framing on people. In the third section, I stress how media framing forms or changes public discourse. In the fourth section, I talk about the influence of mass media on social movements, focusing on the media's mobilizing ability. In the fifth section, I review the literature on framing theory including the grievance frame, frame alignment theory, and political opportunity frame. Further, I use the concepts identified in this chapter to develop my coding sheet.

2.1 Frame and Framing

The term “frame” is originally used by Goffman (1974: 21) to indicate “schemata of interpretation” that enable a person “to locate, perceive, identify, and label” information or events happening around them. Frames are like windows through which individuals look at things and individuals need them in order to simplify, perceive, and react to their environment. Each person has his own windows, that is, his unique way of perceiving reality; this is one reason why different people have various opinions on the same thing. Framing is a process of presenting events and occurrences through communication based on an individual's own perceptions. When people talk, they tend to make some aspects of perceived reality more salient than the rest. In such a way, they implicitly identify a particular problem, present a causal interpretation, make moral judgments, or suggest possible treatments for that problem. Certain perceived ideas may be promoted and articulated. When other individuals pick up these ideas, their recognition and feelings are influenced. They may, for example, be

led to grievance or anger about a situation. Eventually, they may be guided to take actions to ease the dissatisfaction.

2.2 Media Frames and Media Framing

Mass media has become an important source of information in today's society. People spend many hours watching television, surfing the Internet, reading newspapers and books, and listening to radios. Since many people do not experience political events in person, news becomes a very significant source of information and news framing impacts an individual's beliefs and perceptions of public events (Iyengar 1987). In particular, when frames fit people's preexisting biases, they are likely to receive the information and be led to think and react in a certain way. Under this circumstance, news could be found both helpful and harmful depending on the quality and content of the information.

Mass media has "persistent patterns of cognition, interpretation, and presentation, of selection, emphasis, and exclusion, by which symbol-handlers routinely organize discourse, whether verbal or visual" (Gitlin 1980: 7). The patterns are called media frames. News agencies, such as newspapers, radio, or television, adopt their own organizational ideas and principles, which are called media frames or news frames (Gitlin 1980; Gamson & Modigliani 1989). These frames function to select, emphasize, or exclude information; they make some issues seem more problematic than the others, formulate casual interpretations, make moral evaluations, and recommend solutions (Entman 1993: 52).

Media framing can happen whether information senders are conscious or unconscious since it is possible for frames to become a routine in the process of sending information. Conscious framing often happens when message senders intend to direct receivers' thoughts and reactions (Gamson 1988). For example, the media transmits information in a way that is favored by the government to affect people or impose certain ideologies on them. Furthermore, news media is not only a public instrument, but also a business that is sensitive to a very competitive market. News agencies might apply certain

frames in order to maintain or increase the number of readers or audiences. Unconscious framing takes place when journalists adopt their employer's frames in making and reporting their news stories. For example, journalists who are often under the urgency of deadlines are more likely to just follow the same organizing frames; second, their supervisors prefer news written in certain ways. Although the readers and audiences are not passive receivers, they can be influenced by the frames.

2.3 Media Discourse and Public Discourse

News frames composed in texts of newspapers can make certain information more salient by repetition or by associating the information with culturally familiar symbols (Entman 1993: 53). In this way, an issue is more likely to draw receivers' attention and be considered significant. Scheufele (1999) suggests that a notion can be highly salient to the readers if it is connected with their existing belief systems. The greater the correspondence between the ideas presented by the communicators and those of the receivers, the more likely the ideas are accepted by the audiences or readers.

How are an individual's beliefs concerning certain issues developed into consensus in the field of public discourse? It is through mass media. According to Johnston and Klandermans (1997: 47), "public discourse implies interplay of media discourse and interpersonal interactions." Mazur (1988) suggests that mass media is very powerful in creating a climate favorable to certain issues and influencing both public perceptions and behavior. Originally, individuals might have antithetic, sympathetic, or indifferent attitudes toward an issue and they prefer to gather and share opinions with those who are like-minded. Once they identify themselves with certain groups or organizations that share similar opinions, it is more likely for individuals to fully adopt the collective beliefs. That is to say, individuals are influenced by the media and they bring their opinions to their personal networks and influence other people. After collective beliefs are built up, there is a preexisting line of thought within various groups and organizations (Klandermans 1992). At that time, media discourse is able to create

favorable public discourse by presenting news facts along with the opinions that are already in personal networks and circles (Gamson 1992; Gamson & Modigliani 1989).

2.4 Mass Media and Social Movements

Mass media has become one of the most important mobilizing elements for social movements in modern society (McAdam, McCarthy, and Zald 1996; Gamson & Wolfsfeld 1993; Koopmans 2004). "Movements need the news media for three major purposes: mobilization, validation, and scope enlargement" (Gamson & Wolfsfeld 1993: 116). First, it is not enough for social movement activists just to exchange information with their friends and relatives within their personal networks. In order to initiate and sustain a social movement, activists must utilize public media to reach more potential participants other than people in social activists' personal networks. Second, a protest event not covered by the media can be regarded as a non-event. Gamson and Wolfsfeld (1993), for example, said: "No news is bad news" (p. 116). Thus, in order to obtain recognition by the public, the social elites, and the political elites, media attention is necessary (Kielbowicz and Scherer 1986). Appearing on media coverage validates the importance of a social movement and is more likely to mobilize bystanders to have sympathy toward the protests and to eventually participate. Third, mass media is crucial in making the issues of the movement more widely known. The issues that cause social unrest are controversial. In addition, in most cases, social movements are in opposition to mainstream ideology and their leaders and participants are on the margins within a society. Thus, a social movement needs the media and media coverage to strengthen the mobilization and to legitimize movement organizations and their activities.

2.5 Framing Theory In Social Movements

2.5.1. Grievance Theory

Smelser claims that there are always prevailing grievances in a society caused by structural factors (1971). Grievances are significant element in originating social movements and yet, they will not lead to movement participation until they are perceived (Smelser 1971).

Smelser's perspective corresponds to Snow and Benford's (1988) viewpoint that participants of social movements are socially constructed rather than structurally guaranteed. A successful framing is able to translate vaguely felt dissatisfaction into well-defined grievances and eventually persuade people to take action.

Piven and Cloward (1979) demonstrate that there is a significant prerequisite for people to change their beliefs and be brought into collective action. People have to come to recognize that the authority or institutions are unjust or wrong. When there is a situation, such as job loss, individuals tend to blame themselves rather than the system. This is called "fundamental attribution error" (Ross 1977). Individuals need to be led to believe that the problems they encounter in their lives are due to the injustice of the government or the authority instead of their own faults. Namely, they need to turn from individual factors of responsibility to situational factors of responsibility (Klandermans 1987; McAdam, McCarthy, and Zald 1996: 9; Snow et al. 1986).

2.5.2 Core Framing Tasks

According to Snow and Benford (1988), grievances are framed in three ways: diagnostic framing, prognostic framing, and motivational framing. First, diagnostic framing identifies a problem and determines who or what is to blame. It asks the question, "What is the problem?" This process persuades individuals to identify the source of the problem. Second, prognostic framing provides possible solutions to the identified problem. This process answers the question, "What should be done to solve the problem?" It provides appropriate tactics and strategies.

When diagnostic and prognostic framings are taken together, they compose consensus formation, referring to the "unplanned convergence of meaning in social networks and subcultures" (Snow and Benford 1988: 175). These two framing procedures are utilized to form a prevailing recognition of the problem and solutions on a corporate level. As a result, a group

of potential participants whom Klandermans (1988) calls “the mobilization pool” is generated, which brings in the third stage, motivational framing.

Motivational framing gives answer to: “How should we carry out what must be done?” It contains words that issue a call for action, intending to mobilize the potential participants (Klandermans 1988,1992; Benford 1993; Benford and Snow 2000). Nevertheless, the proliferation of motivating messages does not spontaneously bring people to protest. To agree with and support a social movement is one thing, but to participate is another due to the cost of time and money. Facing this problem, Klandermans claims that individuals act according to the perceived costs and benefits (1984: 584-585). Therefore, based on his idea, part of the motivational strategies is to convince people that their presence at the demonstration will change the situation (McAdam 1982: 52).

Mass media can have a positive or negative influence on social movements during the frame alignment process. The reason lies on the participation of other actors, including social movement organizations, opponents, the political system, and bystanders (Klandermans 1992). In other words, social movements confront framing contests. Framing contests refer to “a struggle among various actors to determine whose definition of the situation will prevail” (Klandermans 1992: 100). Social movements need to compete with other agents for media attention and public support. Specifically, there are always “counterframes” (Benford 1987: 75) from movements’ main opponents: governmental institutions, enterprises, elites, and political parties (Klandermans 1992: 96). The government agencies are often identified by challengers as responsible objects for problems and, thus, are enemies of social movements. However, most of the time, official discourse is privileged in regular access to mass media, which makes them more competitive in framing contest. Therefore, movement activists need to continuously defend themselves, such as reiterating their values, legitimatizing their goals and means, or incorporating new elements into movement activities in order to keep media attention.

2.5.3 Framing Political Opportunity

Political opportunities refer to openings in the political-institutional structure which have the potential to give rise to social movements (Gamson and Meyer 1996; McAdam 1982). There are times when governmental control over society is loosened, such as during conflicts among the political elites or the dysfunction of administrative system. However, people in the society might not always be aware of the opportunities. Thus, they rely on news media. Journalists are interested in controversial issues because they are newsworthy. Issues such as divisions among political elites or political parties have a good chance to be shown on the news. With this information, activists are more likely and able to challenge the authority. Therefore, in order to convince people to participate in protests, framing political opportunities becomes an important part in movement frames. Usually, in the process, a situation will be defined as problematic. Also, the need and possibility of changing it will be emphasized.

Along with this line, Gamson and Meyer (1996) stressed that three themes are employed by movement activists: urgency, agency, and possibility (p. 286). First, activists point out the urgent need of taking actions now. Otherwise, the opportunities will be gone and it will be more difficult or impossible later to change the situation. In addition, movement frames might create a deeper division among the political elites and, thus, expand the political opportunity. Positive reactions from the elites toward collective actions help mobilization. Finally, activists provide a vision for potential participants -- for example, the movement will result in a better society. It is argued that, most of the time, challengers emphasize opportunities in the system rather than the constraints. Nonetheless, movement frames may stimulate actions that enlarge opportunity, making their opportunity frame a self-fulfilling prophesy (Gamson and Meyer 1996: 287).

Under this situation, openness of the media system to social movements is in fact a political opportunity. If national newspapers and newsmagazines offer space to a social

movement, the movement frames and information will spread to and influence other media organizations, elites, and the public. In some cases, media pays so much attention to social movements that it becomes a part of a shared movement culture and even functions as a social movement organization.

2.5.4 Counterframes

Framing contests are always taking place. When a social movement is brought forth, framing contests are also happening among the various social actors, such as media, social movement organizations, state, and other countermovement powers. The contests determine which definitions of the situation prevail and they can create either opportunities or constraints for social movements. In order to defend and sustain the protests, movement organizers have to compete for media attention. A tactic of social movements of gaining media attention is violence. As Gamson and Meyer (1996: 288) say, "Fire in the belly is fine, but fire on the ground photographs better." Hence, although being perceived as too aggressive might result in losing some supporters, many movements deliberately create violent incidents to maintain the attention of the media.

2.6 Summary

In summary, mass media has become one of the most powerful mobilizing tools for social movements. Media organizations convey the information of a social movement based on their particular frames with which they diagnose the problems (diagnostic frames), recommend possible solutions (prognostic frames), and eventually inspire people to take actions (motivational frames). Also, media is able to utilize and even create political opportunities for social movements to take place. When the frames fit people's existing beliefs, they can motivate people to support or even to participate in the social movement. Nevertheless, when a social movement is taking place, there are framing contests among the social movement organization, the government, and other countermovement power competing for media's

attention. If media picks up frames that counter to the social movement frames, it is likely to demobilize people or to drive participants away.

CHAPTER 3

THE POLITICAL AND SOCIAL BACKGROUND OF TAIWAN

In this chapter, I describe the social background of Taiwan at the time of the Red-Shirt Movement. First, I provide a brief description of Taiwan's political climate. Second, I discuss the role of mass media discuss with specifics on the positions of its two major newspapers, United Daily News (聯合報) and Liberty Times (自由時報). Third, I present details of the corruption allegation against President Chen Shui-bian and a chronology of the Red-Shirt Movement. Finally, I state the purpose of this thesis.

3.1 Political Climate

After the lifting of martial law in 1987, Taiwan has become more democratic politically. After the ban on newspapers was removed in 1987, the influence of the western mass media brought Taiwan further into the freedom of democracy. Economically, from the 1970s until 2000, the average rate of annual economic growth was kept at around 10 percent. This economic advancement contributed to the maturity of Taiwan's democracy. Taiwanese people were released from the political suppression of martial law and were less occupied with trying to meet their basic needs. Instead, they turned to care more about social issues and the fight for civil rights, such as rights to participate in public affairs and to free speech.

The government of Taiwan is a presidential system. There are two major political parties in Taiwan, the Democratic Progressive Party (DPP) and the Kuomintang (KMT) that is also known as the Nationalist Party. The KMT was formed in 1919 in mainland China. It fled to

Taiwan after losing the civil war to the Communist Party in 1947¹. In order to suppress the Communist activities and fully control the people in Taiwan, martial law was imposed in 1949 and not lifted until 1987. After that, the KMT still reigned authoritatively as a dominant party until 2000. KMT was mostly composed of the mainlanders who came to Taiwan with the retreated army and still had emotional ties to mainland China. Thus, the KMT embraced the idea of reunification of mainland China and Taiwan.

After the KMT moved from China to Taiwan in 1949, the leader Chiang Kai-shek and his regime upheld the “one China” principle, hoping one day they could reunite with mainland China under one government. Many means were adopted to impose the “greater China identity”, such as forcing the islanders to accept that “both Taiwan and China were parts of China and that China was their motherland” (Wang and Chang 2006: 379). Additionally, the development of the “greater China identity” penetrated into every aspect of people’s lives, especially in the areas of education and mass media. The activists who supported or encouraged the development of an independent Taiwan identity were oppressed. After the 228 Incident in 1947, a violent confrontation between KMT police and native islander supporters, the KMT regime considered the advocates of Taiwan independence and democratization as threats to national security. Many were put into prison or forced to exile in the period from the 1950s to the 1970s, which was called “white terror.”

During the late 1980s and 1990s, a rapid democratization took place leading to tremendous changes in policies of political tolerance in Taiwan, which “included the lifting of martial law, legalizing political parties, ending restrictions on public assembly, and freedom of speech” (Wang and Cheng 2006:379). In 1988, Lee Teng-hui, the first native-born president, came into power. For the first time, the people of this island could openly advocate for an

¹ From 1895 to 1945, Taiwan was ceding to Japan in perpetuity by the Chin Dynasty. After Japan’s being defeated in World War II, Chiang Kai-shek was decreed to inherit Japan’s colonies on behalf of the Allied Force in 1945. Chiang officially moved to Taiwan in 1949 after being defeated by Mao Ze-dong, a communist leader who later became the first chairman of the Communist Party of China.

independent Taiwan. Moreover, there were significant changes in the constitution during Lee's tenure as president, which weakened the propaganda of China-centered ideology promoted by the earlier regime. Consequently, various opinions other than "one China" emerged, increasing political tolerance.

Under this kind of atmosphere, The Democratic Progressive Party (DPP) was formed in 1986 and later became the ruling party. Being the first opposition party legalized after the lifting of martial law, its main goal was to improve democracy in Taiwan and to fight for political participation of the Taiwanese people. The ultimate goal of the party was to promote Taiwan's independence. In 2000, Chen Shui-bian was elected as Taiwan's president. As the first non-KMT president, Chen Shui-bian and his party, the DPP, ended the KMT's fifty-year authoritative reign in Taiwan. After Chen Shui-bian came into office, Taiwanese consciousness was greatly cultivated and advanced. As the first leader of this island country from the DPP, Chen upheld a "Taiwan First" policy in order to democratize Taiwan and up-root the widespread corruption of the KMT era.

The people of Taiwan align themselves politically along the lines of their ethnicities, national identities, and social classes because of historical factors. The two primary ethnic identities, the native islanders and the mainlanders, tended to align themselves respectively with the Taiwanese identity or the former "greater China identity," which stood for the idea of unification. Due to these differences, the political scene in Taiwan was polarized into two camps: the Pan-Blue camp and the Pan-Green camp. The pan-Blue alliance is composed of the KMT, People First Party (PFP), and the New Party (NP); the pan-Green alliance consists of the DPP, Taiwan Solidarity Union (TSU), and Taiwan Independence Party (TAIP), with the KMT and the DPP being leaders of their respective camp. The term "pan-Blue" indicates party identification. Party identification is a person's emotional attachment to a political party; people identify themselves with different parties according to their own perceptions of the social groups that consist of that party (Green, Palmquist, and Schickler 2002).

Since President Chen Shui-bian was elected, the pan-Blue political parties had been trying to oust Chen by mobilizing supporters, using demonstrations as a tool in their political struggle. On March 19, 2004, one day before the Presidential election, a shooting incident occurred. Both incumbents, President Chen Shui-bian and Vice President Annette Lu, suffered minor wounds. When the incumbents won reelection the next day by a small margin of thirty thousand votes, the opposing candidate, Lien Chan (KMT), claimed that the shooting incident was plotted to help Chen obtain people's sympathy. Thence, Lien and his party members mobilized about a thousand Pan-Blue supporters to protest and demonstrate in front of the Presidential Palace to demand an investigation into the shooting incident and a recount of the ballots (Bradsher 2004). On March 19, 2005, one year after the shooting incident, KMT mobilized almost forty thousand supporters to rally for "democracy, peace, and truth" (Hong 2005). The protestors believed that Chen staged the shooting incident and appealed to the judiciary system give the truth to the public. These protests resulted in a recount, but did not change the outcome of the election.

3.2 Mass Media

In recent years, the mass media in Taiwan was less censored. It prospered and offered the people multiple channels to voice their opinions. Reporters Without Borders published the 2006 worldwide press freedom index and Taiwan ranked 43 (Press Freedom Index 2006). This ranking was even higher than some of the developed countries such as the United States and Japan. It indicated that the mass media in Taiwan was freer than before. However, because of competition among so many media groups and the need of twenty-four-hour broadcasting, news reporting became indiscriminate and unprofessional (Lee 2003). Sometimes, it even went against social morality and violated human rights (World Almanac Education Group 2007), without considering the negative effect on the society and culture (Lee 2003).

To put this in perspective, in 2006, the total population in Taiwan was about twenty-three million. In addition to four major television channels, there were 63 cable television

systems and each had over 100 channels. Also, there were 178 registered radio stations, 2,273 newspapers, 5,349 magazines, and prevalence rate of the Internet was 73.39 percent (Ministry of Transportation and Communications 2006). Among these media, the prevalence rate of the television was 100 percent (Ministry of transportation and communications 2006). A recently published research report (Peng 2006) claimed that the Taiwanese people prefer watching the news channels. Moreover, newspapers which are widely circulated and readily available in the convenient stores, stations, and street stalls for about thirty cents, contribute to the saturation of news and information in the culture.

Generally speaking, media agencies in Taiwan are affiliated with either the pan-Blue camp or the pan-Green camp (Hsiao 2006). The frames these agencies adopt in their interpretation of social, economical, and political issues are often based on their particular political positions. Such political leanings of the media are carried over from the Chiang Kai-shek era. The two newspapers used in this study, United Daily News (UDN) and Liberty Times (LT), have their respective political alignments. Each favors a certain political party in reporting political incidents. UDN was once the voice of the government when the KMT ruled Taiwan authoritatively. It continued this legacy and was, therefore, close to the pan-Blue coalition. On the contrary, LT's political perspectives are inclined toward the pan-Green camp. Hong (2007) stated that in the 2006 Taipei City mayoral campaign, UDN and LT reported on the three candidates with different "journalistic tendencies," different "journalistic positions," and different images -- for example, LT showed preference for the DPP candidate by giving him more coverage and more praises, thus shaping a positive image of him.

3.3 Chen Shui-bian and The Corruption Allegations

Chen Shui-bian was born to a farmer's family in Tainan County, southern Taiwan. He graduated from the Law School of National Taiwan University in 1974 and began practicing as a lawyer in 1976. His first steps into politics were as a defender of democratic activists in the treason trial of Formosa Magazine. This trial was considered a landmark in Taiwan's

democratic progress, which later caused the KMT government to lift the martial law, removing the bans on political parties and newspapers. It also paved a route for Chen Shui-bian to enter politics. In 1981, Chen was elected as a Taipei City councilor and formally started his political career. He joined the DPP in 1987. From 1989 to 1994, he was a legislator from the DPP and was noted for his criticism of the ruling party, KMT. During this time, Chen served as the convener of the National Defense Committee and the DPP's legislative party whip in which his charismatic leadership was shown. Later, in 1994, he was elected as the mayor of Taipei City. Although Chen's achievements were approved by most people, he lost the re-election campaign to the KMT candidate, Ma Ying-jeou, in 1998. This failure actually allowed him to run for president in 2000 when he was successfully elected. Having grown up in a family of tenant farmers and rising to the President's Office, Chen Shui-bian was upheld as a symbol of diligence, sincerity, honesty, and success of the Taiwanese people. In one of his published books, he called himself "the son of Taiwan," referring to his indigence, which brought him the support of the local Taiwanese people.

In the beginning of 2006, President Chen's inner circle and his family members were accused by a legislator from the KMT of using their status to gain personal interests. The deputy secretary-general, Ma Yung-cheng, and Chen's son-in-law, Chao Chien-ming, were said to be involved in insider trading. Then, the first lady, Wu Shu-chen, was accused of receiving gift certificates from a chain department store, which was waiting for the government's permission on management transfer. Moreover, Chen and his wife were accused of inappropriately using the special diplomatic funds that had been under the Taiwan's presidents' personal control (Bradsher 2006). During this time, the president, the first lady, Chen's son-in-law, and a high-ranking official were under investigation. Although these cases were still pending in the judiciary process, the newspapers and television news continually reported the scandals, making them widely discussed among the people. Eventually, in June 2006, legislators from the KMT and PFP filed impeachments against President Chen Shui-bian.

On July 15, scholars from several prestigious academic institutions published the report “Democracy and the Moral Crisis of Taiwan Identity: Our Appeals to the President, the Ruling Party and Taiwan Citizens” urging Chen to step down. They demanded that, in order to maintain the reputation of the DPP, the democratic progress, and the values of Taiwanese society, Chen had to be held responsible for the corruption scandals and resign. Some of these scholars were once democratic activists and were said to be pro-Green.

On August 7th, a former party leader of DPP, Shi Ming-teh, wrote a public letter which was carried in the national newspapers urging President Chen to resign and show his regret for the wrongdoings of his policies in the face of public opinion (see Appendix A for a copy of the letter). In the text, Shi mentioned that his friendship with President Chen was based on their shared well-being and woe. Shi was a well-known democratic activist against the authoritarian KMT government. In the landmark of Taiwan’s democracy, the grand trial of Formosa Magazine, Chen Shui-bian was Shi Ming-teh’s defending lawyer. Shi and Chen both were important figures in the establishing the DPP and fought together against the corruption of the KMT regime. Shi appealed Chen to “step down for the sake of the people and democracy of Taiwan,” but did not obtain a response from President Chen.

3.4 Shi-Ming-teh and The Red-Shirt Movement

In August 2006, the Red-Shirt Movement took place in front of the Presidential Palace. This depose Bian campaign was led by Shi Ming-teh. Shi was a pioneering leader of demonstrations² against Chiang Kai-shek’s authoritarian and high-pressure rule in Taiwan. He was widely known as a democratic and independent activist, having his teeth shattered twice by guards during a twenty-five-year imprisonment while Taiwan was under KMT’s iron fist. Shi was one of the founders of the DPP and was elected as legislator from 1993 to 1996. During this time, he was also a caucus convener of the DPP. In 2000, after President Chen Shui-bian came into office, he declared that his dream of overthrowing the KMT regime had been

² It was called “tangwai” demonstrations

fulfilled. He refused to accept an appointment as senior presidential advisor, and disappeared from politics. However, in 2006, he returned to politics to force out his former comrade, claiming that Chen had ruined the hard-won democracy.

Shi initiated a fund raising campaign in a press conference on August 10th. He claimed that Chen should take responsibility for the corruption charges of his high-rank officials and family members and step down. Also, whoever agreed with this idea could donate \$100 NTD (\$3.33). When donation from the people exceeded \$100,000,000 NTD, there would be a long-term sit-in demonstration demanding that the president to resign.

The social movement organization, the Depose Bian Headquarter, postulated itself as a “spontaneous civil movement” (United Daily News 2006) unaffiliated with any political party, interest group, or organization. Unlike the two protests in 2004 and 2005, the Red-Shirted Movement differed in its way of mobilization and in its constituent. The movement recruits claimed that, unlike the participants of the social movements in the past, the supporters were self mobilized and were mostly families with children who participate in protest for the first time. With participants all dressed in red shirts, waving their thumb-down, and shouting, “A-Bain³, step down,” they presented an impressive display of solidarity. Responding to this colorful and united front, the journalists coined the name “Red-Shirt Movement” and its participants were called the “Red-Shirt Army”.

Although Shi and the movement organizers stated that the demonstration was unaffiliated with any political party, significant support from pan-Blue political elites made Red-Shirt's statement controversial. During the Red-Shirt Movement, the chairman of KMT and mayor Taipei City, Ma Ying-jeou⁴, gave his approval to the twenty-four-hour sit-in

³ A-Bian is the nickname of then-President, Chen Shui-bian.

⁴ Ma, incidentally, was seen as a backbone member of KMT. He started out his political career by taking on different public official positions or party cadres. From 1993 to 1996, Ma served in the Minister of Justice where he initiated a campaign against corruption, illegal drugs, and vote-buying. The campaign also included cracking down on organized crime and reform of the prison system. His many contributions won the respect of the people and established an image

demonstrations in front of the Presidential Palace even though it was considered illegal to have round-the-clock protests. The other pan-Blue political leader allying with the movement leader was James Soong, the chairman of People First Party (PFP). The endorsement of the two significant pan-Blue politicians on the movement brought many pan-Blue supporters to participate in it.

The Red-Shirt Movement was active not only in the demonstrations and sit-ins in Taipei City, but also was seen protesting throughout Taiwan. On August 10, 2006, the Movement leader, Shi Ming-tehh, initiated the “One Million People against Bian” campaign to raise funds for the long-term sit-in demonstrations in front of the Presidential Palace. Within one week, the Movement collected more than one billion New Taiwan Dollars (NTD) from its supporters (Depose Bain Headquarter 2006).

3.5 The Red Shirt Movement’s Four Major Activities

From August 10, 2006 to October 10, 2006, except for the sit-in demonstrations in front of the Presidential Palace and Taipei Station, the Red Shirt movement had four major activities. The first activity named “The Nazca Line” was brought forth on September 9. This activity took place in front of the Presidential Palace on Ketagalan Boulevard in Taipei. UDN (September 10) reported that, according to the movement organizers, the activity successfully gathered more than three hundred thousand supporters. The Taipei City Police Department said that there were ninety thousand demonstrators. The second activity was “Besieging the City with Lights (AKA: Encircling the City)” on September 15, 2006. The movement organization (UDN September 16, 2006) said that over seven hundred and fifty thousand people participated. Taipei City Police Department’s record showed that three hundred and sixty thousand people participated.

of incorruptibility. Ma was elected Mayor of Taipei in 1998 and again, the re-election in 2002. In 2005, he was elected chairman of KMT and was said to be preparing to enter the presidential campaign in 2008.

The third activity, “Blossom Everywhere,” was held from September 29 to October 7, 2006. Over five hundred movement supporters and Shi Ming-teh toured Taiwan to “depose Bian.” The main goal of this activity was to make the Red Shirt movement widely known. UDN reported that, in many provinces, many movement supporters stood on the streets and welcomed Shi and his followers — for example, UDN said that there were over thirty thousand supporters coming to the assembly held by Shi in Taichung province on September 30 (October 1 2006). The final activity, “Besiege,” was held on October 10, 2006, which is Taiwan’s National Day. The movement participants were said to illegally occupy the main traffic lines in Taipei City and were not expelled until midnight. The movement organization claimed that one million and five hundred thousand people participated in this activity. Taipei City Police Department’s estimation was one hundred and twenty-four thousand participants.

Nevertheless, the movement suddenly declined after October 11, 2006 and could never again gather as many as it had during the earlier protests. On September 1, 2007, Shi Ming-teh and the movement organizers summoned the “Red-Shirt Army” to come back to the streets and planned to rally on September 9 and from October 7 to 11 (Huang 2007). Compared to the four major demonstrations in 2006, the number of the participants was so small that the movement organization did not make the number public.

3.6 Significance of the Red Shirt Movement

The Red-Shirted Movement is worthy to be studied because the following reasons. First, both the number of participants and the amount of funds involved were the greatest in Taiwan’s social movement history. Second, the mass media of Taiwan gave large portions of coverage to the movement for more than one month. Meanwhile, the movement messages and demands gained the attention of the international media and pressed the incumbents to take actions. Most important of all, the movement reflected Taiwan’s mass media had significant influence on the people.

One of the most important characteristics of the Red-Shirt Movement was its high rate of exposure in the mass media (Chen 2007; Chiang 2008; Shi 2007). Shi (2007: 91) describes the first activity of the Movement, the “Nazka Line,” as being “reported by almost all the media in Taiwan over the weekend, and some pro-Blue media⁵ even covered it twenty-four hours a day, seven days a week.” Shi also identified coverage of this Movement by many international media, including American Free Press Newspaper (AFP) and British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC) News (2008: 91). Moreover, in his interview of the Movement organizers, Chen (2008) points out that the mass media successfully spread the movement messages and motivated individuals to participate in the movement.

A series of articles have been written by scholars in Taiwan on the Red-Shirt Movement. Fan (2007) looked into the role of the Red-Shirt Movement in Taiwan’s process of democratization; Wu (2007) probed the emergence, cause, process, and development of the Red-Shirt Movement based on Taiwan’s political and economic transformations; Chiang (2009) saw the Movement from the theory of justification of civil disobedience. Last but not least, the scholars specializing in journalism looked into: the relationship among the mass media, the Movement, and the rhetorical vision (Lee 2008); the viewpoints of the Depose Bian organizers and newsmakers (Chen 2008); and the interaction between the mass media and the Movement organizers (Feng 2008; Chiang 2008). Although the literature pointed out that the mass media had divisive perspectives on the Red-Shirt Movement, there was a gap in the literature: it did not provide explanations to the sudden decline of the movement.

3.7 The Purpose of This Study

The social movement literature claims that mass media in the present society has become a significant mobilizing tool for social movements by means of framing. When social movements obtain positive attention from the mass media, the convergence of the movement

⁵ Or, “pro-China media.” Their political stands are closer to the ones of the pan-Blue camp and incline to support the re-unification with China.

frames and media frames tend to originate and sustain the social movement. On the contrary, when mass media gives counterframes, the social movement might suffer a fall. Also, the significant frames include diagnostic frames, prognostic frames, motivational frames, political opportunity frames, cultural familiar symbols, and counterframes.

In this paper, I study the influence of the media on the rapid rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement by examining changes in the media frames on the social movement and the government. In the case of the Red-Shirt Movement, one observed fact was that it obtained much Taiwan's media attention, both in the beginning and during the four highlighted demonstrations. According to this observed fact, I pose a question: Did the media frames influence the rapid rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement?

CHAPTER 4

SOURCE OF DATA AND METHODOLOGY

I divide this chapter into six sections. The first section is an introduction to content analysis. In the second section, I describe the data, including the characteristics of the two newspapers selected for this study. In the third section, I identify and justify the dates and timelines. In the fourth section, I discuss the sampling procedures including where and how the data were collected. I also include counts of the sampled articles from the two newspapers for each time period. In the fifth section, I define the main concepts contained in the coding sheet. Finally, in the sixth section, I describe how I analyzed the data.

4.1 Content Analysis

Content analysis is an approach used by researchers to analyze data in the form of human communications that are recorded, such as printed news articles, taped television shows, and recorded radio programs. Holsti defines content analysis as “any technique for making inferences by objectively and systematically identifying specified characteristics of messages” (1969: 14). I use content analysis to examine data from newspaper articles. In order to enable interviews, field notes, or other unobtrusive data applicable for research, researchers need to go through an objective coding process. Coding transforms raw data into a standardized form, “a set of categories that represent some characteristics of research interest” (Babbie 2007: 325; Singleton & Straits 2005: 371). Through this process, the conveyed information becomes systematically comparable. I describe coding process in more detail below.

Content analysis can be quantitative or qualitative. In a quantitative analysis, researchers determine the frequency of relevant categories by counting the appearances of certain words or phrases on the coding sheets. In a qualitative content analysis, researchers

examine the senders', writers', or speakers' ideological mind-sets, themes, topics, symbols, and other similar phenomena (Berg 2004: 269). By using qualitative analysis, researchers can not only conduct analysis on literal words or phrases, but also on their meanings in relation to the whole text. Researchers could, thus, be given a better sense of the latent viewpoints of the authors and their research results could then be more valid. In this paper, I will use a combination of quantitative and qualitative content analyses of newspaper articles (Berg 2004) to examine the frames used by the Red-Shirt Movement organization, the government, and the mass media.

4.2 Data Description

In this paper, I use content analysis to analyze secondary data from two sources: newspaper articles from United Daily News (UDN) and Liberty Times (LT). I collected political news articles published between August 1, 2006 (before the movement's fund-raising campaign) and October 25, 2006 (the last news coverage of the movement.) I collected the news articles from the electronic newspaper archives of UDN (<http://udndata.com/>) and LT (<http://iservice.libertytimes.com.tw/IService2/search.php>). I also gathered press releases of the movement organization from the organization's official website (<http://www.deposewww.com/>).

I chose newspapers as the object of analysis for three reasons. First, the contents of newspaper articles tend to provide deeper and more complete pictures of an event than those given by television news. Second, they are available for readers to read again and again (Choi and Becker 1987). In the case of the Red-Shirt Movement, the newspapers contain detailed information, such as the place and time of a planned demonstration. The printed words could become a reminder to its active participants and a motivating message to the bystanders. Third, other than electronic media, print media is significant in affecting the nature, development, and result of a social movement (Kielbowicz and Scherer 1986: 72). Social movements that desire to make their grievances and goals known to the public have to get their messages into the mass media. To access the mass media means to make the concerns and

events of a social movement newsworthy. This process influences a social movement's path and, thus, changes its end.

The two newspapers that I selected are the two most widely circulated newspapers in Taiwan. They are published daily and distributed nationally. The daily circulation of UDN is six hundred thousand, and that of LT is seven hundred thousand. Respectively, their daily circulations represent 2.6 percent and 3 percent of the whole population of Taiwan. They are the two leading representatives of Taiwan's news print media in terms of their political ideologies, each claiming a readership of its political inclination. The UDN was established in 1951 when Taiwan was under the authoritarian reign of the KMT. It used to be the mainstream newspaper that served as a voice for the government. Thus, UDN's political ideology is close to the pan-Blue camp favoring the unification of Taiwan and mainland China. It has more pan-Blue readers. The LT, in contrast, was established in 1980. Its main objective is to advocate for liberty and Taiwan-centered concepts. The political stand of LT is more native, closer to the pan-Green camp, which advocates for the independence of Taiwan. It has more pan-Green readers (Hsiao 2006). Being aligned with the DPP in its values and political ideology, LT has become the biggest newspaper publisher in Taiwan after the shift in political power in 2000.

In Taiwan, newspapers are important mediators in transmitting political information and shaping people's political attitudes (Hsiao 2006). Newspaper readers have more political knowledge than those who watch television or who do not read newspapers (Wang 2007). The readers' political attitudes are often influenced by the newspapers, which further affect people's political behaviors (Hsiao 2006). In other words, newspapers are able to represent and influence people's viewpoints and reactions to political events. Therefore, I analyze newspapers articles to better understand how media affects the Red-Shirt Movement.

4.3 Dates and Timeline

From August 2006 to October 2006 there are four major movement activities that are marked as highlighted the Red-Shirt Movement. In order to test how the newspaper reports

affect the rise and fall of the movement, its timeline is divided into five periods according to these four movement activities. I sampled news articles from these five time periods. The first time period is from August 10 to September 9, 2006, which spans from the first fund-raising campaign, “One Million People against Bian,” on August 10 to the first demonstration, “The Nazca Line” on September 9. The second time period is from September 10 to September 15 when the second activity, “Besieging the City with Lights (aka: Encircling the City)” was held September 15. The third time period covers news stories from September 16 to September 29. The “Blossom Everywhere” activity started on September 29, which was when Shi Ming-teh and more than five hundred participants toured central and southern Taiwan to declare their determination to fight against corruption and to depose President Chen. The fourth time period ranges from September 30 to October 10, 2006. The fifth time period is from October 11 to November 6, 2006. The movement suddenly declined during this time period and eventually lost the media attention altogether.

4.4 Sampling Procedure

I collected news articles of the UDN and LT from their news archives on the Internet. In the process of collection, I use three key search terms: “depose Bian,” (Bian is the nickname of President Chen), “impeachment,” and “state affairs funds.” I only sampled front-page articles because they were considered significant events by the newspapers and had more opportunities on affecting people’s perceptions. There are 76 front page news articles in total, including 60 articles from UDN and 16 from LT. I sampled 40 of these 76 articles, 8 from each time period. The number of articles collected from each newspaper in each time period is listed in the table below. I consider these articles adequate and their numbers sufficient to characterize the newspaper coverage because they reach the saturation point – that is, there is limited variability across articles. Therefore, coding additional articles does not provide any new information.

In the process of sampling, I adopt purposeful and random sampling. First, I sampled news articles from UDN and LT on the same dates, including nine articles from each newspaper. By sampling in this way, it is easier for me to compare and contrast news frames between UDN and LT articles because the news articles would be referring to the same events and issues. Second, I sampled the remaining articles are then randomly sampled using a random number generator⁶. In my sampling, I selected all or nearly all LT articles published in each time period to ensure a sufficient number of articles for comparison.

Table 4.1 The Numbers of News Articles From Both Newspapers

	United Daily News (UDN)	Liberty Times (LT)
8/10 ~ 9/9	6 out of 23	2 out of 2
9/10 ~ 9/15	5 out of 6	3 out of 3
9/16 ~ 9/29	4 out of 16	4 out of 5
9/30 ~ 10/10	6 out of 8	2 out of 2
10/11 ~ 11/6	4 out of 7	4 out of 4
Total	25 out of 60	15 out of 16

4.5 Creation of the coding sheet

In the coding process, I code the manifest content and latent content at the same time. The principle for manifest coding is “what you see is what you get.” The focus is on the surface meaning of the content. The relevant elements are transparent and countable. Latent analysis is done by reading carefully between the lines, examining the deep structural meaning conveyed by the messages (Riffe, Lacy & Fico 1998; Berg 2004). Conducting both manifest and latent coding is the best way to be valid and reliable with respect to the depth and specificity of understanding (Babbie 2007: 325).

⁶ <http://www.random.org/>

The coding sheet contains seven major frames, all of which are derived directly from my review of the social movement literature and framing theory in chapter two (see Appendix B for a copy of the coding sheet). The coding sheet contains space for manifest content, which includes a focus on diagnostic frames, prognostic frames, motivational frames, political opportunity frames, political context, and cultural familiar symbols, as well as for latent content. With the frames in mind, I coded the articles in Chinese in order to be consistent. During this process, I revised the coding sheets three times as I became more familiar with the technique. I also translated the crucial content into English.

The diagnostic frame defines current situations as problematic; the prognostic frame provides the possible solution; and the motivational frame issues a call for people to take action. UDN reported the corruption allegation against President Chen and the events surrounding it as the diagnostic frame. UDN also suggested that the Red Shirt movement was a means to improve the current situation. An example for motivational frame is as follow. On September 14, the day before the second movement activity, UDN covered detailed movement information. The term “peace and nonviolence,” which emphasizes on reducing the cost of movement participation, was used six times.

There are often framing contests among competing actors and in this case, they were between the Red Shirt movement and the government. LT frames overlapped with those of the government and often criticized the Red Shirt Movement for having low legitimacy. Some examples include allegations of its illegality, violence, conflicts, and instigating hatred. UDN, by contrast, used defensive strategies to legitimize the movement goals and means by quoting the movement leader’s emphasis on peace and nonviolence.

A political opportunity frame refers to the opening of chances within a political structure for social movements to take place (Gamson & Meyer 1996; McAdam 1982). In this frame, three concepts are emphasized: the right timing to take action, divisions among the elites, and possibility of achieving the movement goal and improving the current social situation. Several

possible examples might include: (1) UDN cited statements from the movement leader emphasizing that it was a historical moment for taking action; (2) lists of those who once supported Chen, but were now turning their backs on him; and (3) reports of legislators from the KMT throwing out impeachment bills against President Chen.

Culturally familiar symbols are used by social movements to gain people's attention (Entman 1993: 53). Morality is the main cultural frame used by the Red Shirt movement organization. For example, moral virtues including propriety, righteousness, integrity, and honor are considered as part of the foundation of Taiwanese society. The people are familiar with these four virtues because every student in elementary school is asked to recite their definitions. In this case, UDN adopts movement frames and declares that, due to the corruption allegations, President Chen and his family do not meet these moral standards should be disqualified for leadership.

Finally, in addition to manifest content, I also analyze the latent content, which refers to my interpretation and impression of the articles, key quotes, and other notable things. This frame occurs when journalists unconsciously follow the same organizing ideas in writing news stories. In this case, when I compared the news articles from the UDN and the LT, I found that they often reported the same event from different or even opposed perspectives. For example, articles from UDN tend to include more citations from the movement organizers and political elites who support the movement while LT quotes mostly from the government, and the movement's opponents.

4.6 Analysis

In this thesis, I attempt to explain the rapid rise and fall of the Red-Shirt Movement. The principal argument is that when frames of a social movement organization, the government, and the mass media converge, a social movement is more likely to be brought forth and sustained, whereas the fragmentation of these frames leads to the decline and dispersion of a social movement. Since mass media is an important element in originating and

sustaining social movements, the movement organization, the government, and other social actors must compete with one another for media attention. Depending on whose frame the media adopts, the overlap or the absence of overlap can contribute to the rise and fall of a social movement.

To complete the analysis, I read through the coding sheets within each time period, write detailed summaries for each time period (see Appendix C for these summaries), and look for changes across time periods and newspapers. In this process, I record the numbers of the various frames included in UDN and LT and observe their changes over time. Also, I analyze the changes in the content of these frames over the five time periods and across UDN and LT, with a focus on their trends, their consistency and fragmentation with the social movement frames and the government frames. The result illustrates how frames of the newspapers aligned with that of the social movement organization and of the political elites correspond to the rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement.

CHAPTER 5

ANALYSIS

5.1 Cross-time Comparisons Within UDN and LT

In this chapter, I compare the frames within UDN and LT over the five time periods. The purpose of the comparisons is to examine evidence of the frames' correspondence to movement development. I include detailed summaries and media frames by time period and newspaper in Appendix C and Appendix D. The analyses presented below are based on trends and patterns identified in the detailed accounts.

5.1.1 Analysis of UDN Articles

The news frames adopted by UDN overlapped with the frames of the Red Shirt movement in the first four time periods. The frames that frequently appeared were: diagnostic frames, motivational frames, political opportunity frames, and counterframes.

5.1.1.1 Diagnostic Frames

UDN covered diagnostic frames over the five time periods, which consistently indicated that President Chen and the first lady were corrupt. Snow and Benford (2000: 615) claim that diagnostic frames identify the object of blame in a problematic situation. In each time period, UDN had at least one news article reporting the corruption accusation against President Chen and his wife. The articles discussed the judiciary investigations of President Chen and his wife's unreported jewelry and the couple's being suspected of embezzling national funds apportioned for secret foreign affairs. Through these stories, UDN conveyed a negative image of the president and validated the accusations made by the Red Shirt movement.

5.1.1.2 Motivational Frames

Motivational frames compel people to engage in social movements and sustain their participation (Snow & Benford 2000: 617). UDN covered motivational frames in the first four

time periods. Over the first four time periods, some of the elements appeared repeatedly, including Shi Ming-teh's motivating calls for participants, the reiteration of movement goals and values, the positive prediction and outcome of the movement activities, and negative images of the government. In the second and third time periods, there were six motivational frames; yet, in the fourth time period, the number of the frames dropped to two.

As time progressed, however, more elements were added to widen the frames. A new factor was added in the second time period, for example, stressing that the Red Shirt movement had been gathering more people and was becoming stronger over time. In the third time period, UDN pointed out that there were confrontations between Chen's supporters and the movement participants, which resulted in social unrest. From early on, UDN and the Red Shirt movement had been confronting counterframes from LT and DPP. These counterframes denounced the movement as having low legitimacy and generating social costs. The widening of the motivational frames could be interpreted as a defense to these counterframes in order to keep movement participants.

5.1.1.3 Political Opportunity Frames

UDN included political opportunity frames in the first four time periods. These frames emphasize the opportunity for a social movement in a political institution. They encourage people to challenge authority (Zald 1996). Over the four time periods, political opportunity frames indicated that UDN was an organizational resource for the Red Shirt movement because it became the communication channel of the movement organization. The impeachment bill against President Chen Shui-bian and the support of the political elites, for example, were covered repeatedly. Access to UDN created political opportunities for the Red Shirt movement because UDN validated the movement's significance by reporting it. In addition, UDN with its political slant reported events in a way that helped to generate support for certain movement frames. Thus, UDN garnered more support from the political elites for the movement. The coverage of the impeachment bill and the support of the pan-Blue political elites showed the

movement's influence within the political institution. These frames conveyed a message: the Red Shirt movement faced more opportunities than constraints in the political institution. There were six political opportunity frames in the first and second time periods, one in the third time period, and two in the fourth time period.

In the second time period, more political opportunity frames were added. First, the agency frame stated that there was a division among the political elites and that President Chen was isolated by the DPP members. Under this circumstance, Chen was likely to be ousted by the impeachment bill. Second, the urgency frame indicated that it was the right time to force President Chen out of office. Third, a possibility frame pointed out that if the new generation, that is, those born in the 60's and 70's, would rise up, there would be hope for the DPP.

5.1.1.4 Counterframes

Counterframes were presented by UDN from the third time period. UDN had been supportive of the Red Shirt movement. In the third time period, however, it took a turn. UDN adopted counterframes stating that the Red Shirt movement had caused social confrontations and that it was out of the realm of democracy and the rule of law. Additionally, TSU's spiritual leader and former president, Lee Ten-hui, was quoted denouncing the Red Shirt movement as violating principles of democracy. Lee's political weight could affect his party members' votes, which were relevant to the passing or failing of the impeachment bill in Congress. These are contrary to the movement's motivational frames.

In the fourth time period, UDN included more factors in its counterframes. First, UDN quoted President Chen stating that the Red Shirt movement was unconstitutional and in order to protect the Constitution, he would not step down. This is a counterframe to the Red Shirt movement's motivational frame. It indicated that the movement's goal could not be attained. Second, a poll conducted by UDN showed that the movement had a negative impact on the approval rating of KMT's mayoral candidate in Kaohsiung City. UDN pointed out that this result was derived from the deeper party rift between the pan-Blue and pan-Green

coalitions. Although these counterframes were in contrast to the motivational frames of the movement, they did not initially seem to influence the passion of the movement supporters.

The fifth time period brought even more counterframes from the UDN. First, there was a negative depiction of the outcome of “Besiege” on October 10. It was the first time UDN wrote negatively about the movement activity. UDN aligned its news frame with the counterframes from LT and the government, saying that the demonstration was illegal. Second, UDN reported that the second impeachment bill against President Chen failed in Congress because of a lack of votes. On top of this, there was a division between the KMT and PFP. These counterframes indicated the closing of political opportunities, which implied that it was highly unlikely to oust President Chen by institutional means. Third, another poll conducted by UDN said that over fifty percent of the people did not agree with the third recall motion or the resignation of the cabinet. Also, the percentage of people supporting President Chen’s staying in office until 2008 increased.

5.1.2 Analysis of LT Articles

Over the five time periods, LT consistently covered counterframes against the Red Shirt movement.

5.1.2.1 Counterframes

In the first time period, LT emphasized two counterframes. First, the Red Shirt movement violated the Assembly and Parade law and it was, therefore, illegal and low in legitimacy. LT focused on criticizing the around-the-clock demonstrations. Second, the Red Shirt movement was said to result in social costs of violence which countered its motivational frame of peace and nonviolence. These two counterframes appeared repeatedly in the second, third, and fifth time periods. The number of counterframes changed over time. There were two counterframes in the first time period, four in the second time period, six in the third time period, one in the fourth time period, and four in the fifth time period.

In the second time period, LT pointed out that the Red Shirt movement deepened social division, caused traffic chaos and noise, and resulted in confrontations between Chen's and the movement's supporters. In addition, LT mentioned a planned strike that would take place in October, which would lead to an economic collapse. In the third time period, LT reported the movement being a threat to public security. This would be another element of social cost, generating social disturbances. Finally, in the fifth time period, movement participants' violations of laws and defiance of rules were covered. Over all, violence generated by the Red Shirt movement was emphasized.

Over the five time periods, LT widened the counterframes. In the second time period, LT quoted Lee Ten-hui stressing that the Red Shirt movement was out of the realm of democracy and the rule of law. Additionally, LT covered information on the countermovement, the 916 protest⁷. It emphasized that the 916 protest had obtained support from the pan-Green supporters and the DPP. In the third time period, the counterframes were expanded. First, LT covered the positive outcome of the 916 protest, indicating that it was carried out peacefully. This was contrary to the description LT gave to the Red Shirt movement. Second, Mayor Ma, as a supporter of the Red Shirt movement, the anti-corruption movement, was reported to be corrupt. Third, the articles claimed that the Red Shirt movement should be disbanded to allow people to go back to their normal lives. Fourth, LT stated that the political problems identified by the Red Shirt movement should be resolved through Congress. In the fourth time period, LT expanded the counterframes by reporting that President Chen and the first lady Wu Shu-chen were found innocent. In the fifth time period, LT pointed out that there was a division between the KMT and PFP, which implied a closing of political opportunities. Also, LT reported that the movement lost Mayor Ma's support and faced disapproval of future demonstrations.

⁷ The 916 protest was a demonstration held by a club "Taiwan Society" on September 16, 2006. The recruits and participants attempted to show their support for Taiwan and President Chen.

5.2 Contrast of The UDN and LT Frames

In the chart below, I contrast nine articles from UDN and LT, which referred to the same issues and dates in the five time periods and same issues. As mentioned before, UDN supported the pan-Blue coalition, while LT tended to side with the pan-Green camp. In this case, these two newspapers had different perspectives when they reported the same movement activities and the events around them. UDN expressed more interest in the Red Shirt movement than did LT. From August 10, 2006 to October 25, 2006, UDN had sixty front-page stories about this movement while LT had only sixteen front-page articles. UDN also tended to cover positive results of the movement demonstrations, while LT either excluded the news or transmitted negative impressions of the activities.

Table 5.1 Article Contrast Between UDN and LT

	UDN	LT
8/25	府堅拒 ▪ 交代珍寶 Presidential Spokesperson Refuses to Provide Details of Source of Jewelry	血染政論節目 林正杰毆傷金恆 煒 Blood Stained Political Forum ShowLin Jen-Jieh Slugged Jin Hun-Wei
9/12	六天王共商政局 ... 退場機制 要扁提出來 Six Czars Counsel Strategy ... To Force Bian into Exit Plan	罷工倒台灣? ▪ ▪ 日損 300 億 Strike Collapses Taiwan? Could Cause \$30 Billion Productivity Loss Each Day
9/14	915 圍城施籲和平 昨誓師強 調 和百萬人期約愛與非暴力 扁可能參加 916 挺扁活動 915 Siege to be Peaceful, Yesterday [Shih] Emphasized [His] Contract of Love and Nonviolence with the Million [Participants] Bian Might Attend 916 Support Bian Event	週六抗紅潮 綠下動員令 避免 衝突 警方擴大部署 Anti-Red Tide To Take Place on Saturday, Pan-Green Issues Call To Mobilize Members, Police Increased Force Mobilization to Discourage Conflict
9/15	今夜螢光圍城 ... 施明德強調不 是攻城 Besieging Tonight Shih Min- teh Emphasizes that It is not an Offensive Takeover [of the Presidential Palace]	圍城 vs 挺台 蘇貞昌馬英九籲和平理性 Siege vs. Support Taiwan Su Jen-Chang, Ma Yin-Jeou to Call for Peace and Rationality

Table 5.1 - continued

9/16	圍城成功 數十萬紅衫軍和平贏得勝利 Siege Successful Several Hundreds of Thousands of Red Shirt Army Won the Victory Peacefully	圍城和平 倒扁靜坐移師車站 Siege Peaceful Anti-Bian Sit-in Moved to Central Station
9/23	國務費案 近期再訊扁 Bian will be Summoned Again Soon for the Foreign Aid Embezzlement Case	馬英九特支費 Ma Yin-Jeou Abused Special Expenses
10/2	抱瓦斯桶 擋到扁車隊 Anti-Bian Motorcade Blocked by Man Holding Propane Tank	國務費案 近再就訊扁珍 Bian and [Wife] Jen Will Appear in Court Again for Foreign Aid Embezzlement Case
10/11	天下圍攻 國慶難看 扁噏: 明年起不辦 The Siege [Group] Caused Embarrassment during Independence Day Celebration Bian Chided: No Celebration Activities Next Year	馬英九放任 紅衫軍橫行北市 天下圍攻 違法集遊 Ma Yin-Jeou Obligated Red- shirt Army Took Over Taipei City The Siege [Group] Gathered for Illegal Parade
10/13	扁若 A 錢 10 萬就犯罪 國務費 發票和機密外交領據兜不攏 陳 瑞仁"決戰點是證據" Bian Will Be Found Guilty if Embezzled, Even for Only \$100,000 NTD, If [Bian] Could Not Produce Receipt and Documentation for Foreign Aid Funds, Chen Rei-Run Said, "The Evidence Would Determine the Judgment"	警撤銷倒扁總部 14 至 27 日凱 道集遊權 也違切結 ▪ 容 Police Department Cancels Anti-Bian Group's Ketagalan Blvd Parade Rights for 14th and 27th Because of [Group's] Violations of [Public Gathering] Contract

Through contrasting the articles, I found that there had been frame contests between UDN and LT in diagnostic frames and motivational frames. UDN's frames converged with those of the Red Shirt movement. On the contrary, LT's frames overlapped with the government's frames. UDN and LT countered each other in two main issues: first, the accusation against

President Chen the first lady of corruption (diagnostic frames); second, the Red Shirt movement being an originator of peace or violence (motivational frames).

Diagnostic frames had appeared in UDN since the first time period and were not countered by LT until the third time period. In the first time period, UDN reported that President Chen and his wife owned unreported jewelry, which was not contradicted by LT. On September 23, which was in the third time period, UDN adopted diagnostic frames again, stating that there was enough evidence to indict President Chen and the first lady. On the same day, LT reported a corruption accusation against the KMT's chairman, Ma Ying-jeou, who openly sided with the Red Shirt movement. Further, in the fourth time period, LT reported that the evidences showed that the president and his wife were innocent. These counterframes were contrary to UDN's diagnostic frames. In the fifth time period, UDN covered the same issue, but said that some evidence was in favor of President Chen.

Counterframes to motivational frames had been adopted by LT since the first time period. The contests focused on the movement's motivating chant, that is, peace and nonviolence. In the beginning, LT reported that a movement recruit violently attacked a political analyst, stating the movement was an originator of violence. On September 14 and 15, before the second movement activity, UDN covered the movement leader's address that emphasized peace and nonviolence, reacting to LT's accusation in the first time period. On September 15, LT expanded its counterframes by criticizing the movement as harmful to Taiwan's economy, social stability, and as being unconstitutional. However, LT's widening counterframes did not demobilize the movement supporters from joining in the 915 protest.

In the second time period, both UDN and LT reported the second demonstration, "Encircling the City" on September 16. UDN stressed the peaceful process; LT indicated that the movement was being potentially destructive. This counterframe did not influence the movement supporters, which was shown by the movement's popularity in the third activity.

In the fourth time period, UDN and LT battled in identifying the originator of violence. On October 2, UDN said that Chen Shui-bian's supporters were more violent. LT did not counter this frame until October 11, the fifth time period, stressing that the "Red Shirt Army" was illegal and violent. UDN's accusation that stated Chen's supporters were the originators of violence in the fourth time period was not countered until the fifth time period. This seems to explain the large number of participants in the Besiege event. On October 13, LT said that the government cancelled the permits of future movement demonstration because of its violence and violation of the law. This counterframe corresponded to the fall of the movement.

To conclude, the contests between UDN and LT on diagnostic frame and motivational frames were relevant to the rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement. UDN's motivational frames had been confronted by LT since the first time period and yet, the LT frames did not correspond to the rise of the movement. UDN's political opportunity frames were not countered until the fifth time period by LT, which explained the rise of the movement. Although LT's counterframes in the first four periods did not impact the movement's rise, its counterframes in the fifth time period corresponded to the movement's sudden fall. I will give more detail explanation in next chapter.

CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSION

6.1 Introduction

In my thesis, I use the social movement literature and framing theory to examine the rapid rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement in 2006 through the eyes of the media. The Red Shirt movement rose rapidly, swelled to include several hundred thousand participants, and fell as quickly as it rose. From its inception in August 2006 to its demise in November of the same year, the movement was extensively covered by the mass media, including television, print media, and on the Internet. Building on the literature that claims that mass media plays an important role in the success and failure of social movement organizations (Kielbowicz & Scherer 1986; Gamson & Wolfsfeld 1993; Gamson & Meyer 1996), I analyzed the contents of two leading newspapers and identified the media's frames of the social actors. I investigated the media frames and their correspondence to the rapid rise and fall of the movement. In this final chapter, I use the results of my analysis to explain the rapid rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement and I discuss implications for the social movement and framing literatures.

6.2 The Result

At the beginning of this thesis, I posed the question: Did media frames influence the rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement? My initial hypothesis was that the mass media had a great impact on the Red Shirt movement's rise and fall; without the media's extensive coverage of the movement, the movement would not have been as prominent as it was. As I progressed in my research, I realized that the impact of media frames on the movement's life cycle was complex and the movement's rapid rise and fall were influenced by the interactions of various factors. Motivational frames, political opportunity frames, and counterframes to political opportunity frames seemed to have stronger impacts on the movement's rise and fall. In the following

sections, I will try to connect the political background during the time period of the movement with the media's framing of the movement; I will try to explain the correlation of the two to illustrate the influence of media on the social movement.

6.2.1 The Rapid Rise of The Red Shirt Movement

Taiwanese society is polarized: the pan-Blue coalition versus the pan-Green coalition. The Red Shirt movement came into being when the pan-Green coalition was low in its popularity. President Chen Shui-bian barely survived an impeachment attempt in June. The economic situation was bleak and the perceived suicide and jobless rates were high⁸. This social context created an opportunity for the KMT to regain its power. The goal of the Red Shirt movement matched the KMT's interests. The majority of the movement participants were pan-Blue supporters.

UDN, which is popular among those in the pan-Blue camp, used the diagnostic frame to identify a corrupt president whose removal was the goal of the movement. Coincidental to the number of reported suicides due to the reportedly bleak economic situation⁹, UDN's message was powerful in mobilizing people. The newspapers used prognostic frames to suggest the Red Shirt movement was a strong instrument to change the government. The newspaper's motivational frames transmitted a negative image of the DPP government to the people. These frames motivated the pan-Blue supporters to participate in the Red Shirt movement. The motivational frames also indicated that the pan-Blue coalition supported the Red Shirt movement and agreed with the objects of the Red Shirt movement. The political opportunity frame adopted by the newspapers identified changes within the political structure that encouraged the pan-Blue supporters to challenge the DPP government. This political opportunity frame that was adopted by the UDN at the beginning and expanded as the movement progressed was never countered by the LT until after the Besiege event on October

⁸ The repetitive coverage of pan-Blue media affected the perception.

⁹ The GDP was still growing more than 5% at that time.

10. To conclude, the grievances within the society achieved the saturation point and opportunities were identified and, thus, the Red Shirt movement rose rapidly due to the extensive media coverage and support by prominent media organizations like the UDN.

LT's counterframes appeared throughout the five time periods but they did not seem to influence the participants' passions of going to the demonstrations. The inefficacy of LT's counterframes in the first four time periods shows that their presence is not sufficient to cause the demise of the movement. There are, in other words, other factors impacting their efficacy. As discussed in chapter five, although LT countered UDN's diagnostic frames and motivational frames with contradictory accounts over the first four time periods, UDN reacted to these frames and thus defended the movement. Also, the LT was not a trusted source to the movement supporters and hence, its counterframes were not able to demobilize them. Finally, LT did not have counterframes for every UDN frame, especially to political opportunity frames.

Political opportunities refer to the openings in the political structure and they are linked to real events, such as the impeachment bill against President Chen, that are harder to dispute than a simple motivational statement. Moreover, UDN's extensive coverage gave the movement much attention and created additional political opportunities, such as pan-Blue politicians' support and attendance at movement events. LT was unable to counter these frames until the fifth time period when the real situation had turned.

6.2.2 The Sudden Fall of The Red Shirt Movement

The Red Shirt movement had been having steady and solid support from the pan-Blue camp. Yet, after Besiege, within the pan-Blue coalition, the fragile relationship between the KMT and PFP frayed after their disagreement over the bill for resignation of the presidential cabinet. The PFP subsequently allied with the DPP to reclaim government assets from the KMT. The Red Shirt movement picked up on this initiative in its attempt to sustain its anti-corruption goal. However, the movement's alignment with the PFP and DPP in reclaiming government assets from the KMT resulted in the loss of movement supporters. The reasons

are: First, as discussed above, many participants were mobilized by the KMT politicians' calling. The rising antagonism between the movement and the KMT caused many KMT's supporters to leave. Second, in the beginning, the movement's goal was to oust President Chen and to reform the DPP. Nevertheless, Shi Ming-teh changed his attitude and sought to ally with the DPP before the goal of the Red Shirt movement was attained. This was considered the breaking of a promise, which disappointed many participants.

UDN and LT's counterframes to political opportunity frames after the demonstration, Besiege, on October 10 correspond to the movement's rapid fall. The chairman of KMT, Ma Ying-jeou, suspended his support of the movement, which demotivated many KMT supporters. After the KMT and PFP frayed, the prospect of ousting Chen from office was completely dead, which was sufficient to drive away many movement supporters. Besides, on its own, the Red Shirt movement was reported by both UDN and LT to have caused social unrest, resulting in violent incidents, conflicts, and grievances. It was also accused of causing a deeper rift between KMT and DPP supporters, and, thus, deepening the already existing polarization within the society. UDN was a trusted source among the movement participants and, therefore, its counterframes played an important role in demobilizing demonstrators.

6.3 Implications for the Social Movement Literature and Framing Theory

Based on my comparison of the media frames across the five time periods and newspapers, I conclude that political opportunity frames had the biggest impact on the Red Shirt movement's rise and fall. Why are they important? Because from the preparation of Nasca Line to the mobilization for Besiege, the UDN's political opportunity frames were not contested by the LT; their impact, thus, remained steady through the first four periods. The number of political opportunity frames, which identify the dysfunction and weakness of the Chen's administration and motivate people to challenge the authority, in the beginning was high. Therefore, the uncontested flow of political opportunity frames appears to have encouraged the rise of the movement.

After the Besiege demonstration on October 10, both UDN and LT had counterframes to the political opportunity frames, which indicated that the movement lost the pan-Blue political politicians' support, discussed the failure of the second impeachment bill in Congress due to insufficient votes, and discussed the division between the KMT and PFP within the pan-Blue coalition. These counterframes brought the end of the movement's impact on the political institution to the readers' attention, and quite likely, contributed to the fall of the movement.

My analysis also suggests that motivational frames were important, but only to the rise of the Red Shirt movement. Similar to political opportunity frames, the number of motivational frames was also high in the beginning. Political opportunity frames and motivational frames are very similar. They both motivate people to participate in social movements. Unlike the political opportunity frames, however, the LT started countering motivational frames before Nasca Line took place. The number of LT's counterframes that contradicted motivational frames rose before Blossom Everywhere, dropped during the preparation for Besiege, and rose dramatically after Besiege. The reduction of counterframes before October 10 might be relevant to the large number of participants in the Besiege protest because there were fewer counterframes off-sets to the efficacy of the motivational frames.

Diagnostic frames, prognostic frames, and culturally familiar symbols are less relevant to the rise and fall of the movement. First, UDN had been using the diagnostic frame to identify the problem. This frame consistently appeared throughout the life cycle of the movement, suggesting that this frame is not a source of the fall of the movement. Second, the prognostic frame only appeared in UDN in the first time period. Third, UDN used culturally familiar symbols only once in the first time period. LT had been adopting counterframes against these three frames; I believe that LT's counterframes neutralized their efficacy.

6.4 Conclusion

This research applied the social movement literature and framing theory, which were developed to explain social movements in Western countries, to an Asian country. I draw

several conclusions. First, there was not a significant inconsistency in the application of these theories to my case. That is, social movement literature and framing theory are applicable to this case. In this study, changes in the media frames were significant to explain the rapid rise and fall of the Red Shirt movement. Media framing is an important factor in affecting the social movements' growth and decline. In this case, Taiwan's media had great influences on its people, such as drawing the people to a protest or driving them away. Also, the media of different political stands can greatly affect their audiences or readers. This finding can be replicated and expanded in studies of other social movements. Second, the limitation of this research is that I am not able to access to the tapes that recorded the news, talk shows, and other relevant television programs reporting the Red Shirt movement. The two newspapers I used in this thesis reached around 5.6 percent of the Taiwanese population. Yet, 100 percent of the Taiwanese population has access to television. Therefore, future research should study the influence of news broadcasting on the Red Shirt movement.

APPENDIX A

SHI MING-TEH'S LETTER TO CHEN SHUI-BIAN

Chen Shui-bian Elder Brother Bian:

The situation requires me to write this letter and this has been an extreme torment for me ...

Even as I lift up my pen at this moment bathed in the warm morning sunlight, I am still reluctant to give up our personal and public relationship of over more than two decades.

In the grand trial of Formosa magazine, you were the youngest defending lawyer and I was the "infamous brigand." All the other defendants found lawyers easily, but practically no one dared to defend me ... That historical serial drama has continued to play out to today. We were all important actors.

In 1992, the National Legislature was elected anew and the second Parliament was formed. I was the first ever "General Convener" and you were the "Executive Director." The people had such great expectations of us!

In March 2000, one week before the presidential election, Lin I-hsiung and Ye Jyu-lan accompanied you to meet with me. At the time, the outside was speculating that I would abandon you. During the meeting, I only asked you to guarantee that once you become President: first thing, "Taiwan already has the standing of a sovereign and independent country and will never back down."

Second, "The people of Taiwan have the right to determine their own fates and they will never give that up."

In front of Lin and Ye, you swore to guarantee that. Looking at things now, you have been able to guarantee that so far. That is very pleasing.

But you also leaped ahead to guarantee that after you are elected, you will follow the example of the Formosa era and form a "Five Person Group" and invite "Chairman Shih, Chairman Lin ..." and other party elders to form a "National Political Consultative Group."

But even as those words were still fresh, when you were elected, you invited scholars and people from financial interests who had never been connected to and never participated in the Democratic Progressive Party to form the "National Political Consultative Group." Even then

party chairman Lin I-hsiung was excluded. This was the first step by which your political authority moved towards the "Platinum system" and this was the critical mistake that led to your current predicament. No world leaders would dare to openly embrace so many financial interest groups, provide so much power to the cabinet members and government officials and make no attempt to cover the trading of interests and powers ... You were personally close to the financial interest groups, and so how could your officials, family and relatives not become close to those financial interest groups as well?

The reason why the country has fallen so low has a cause.

In recent years, many vile thinkers have insulted me in many ways because I criticized your "platinum system" and I criticized your violation of the "spirit of the dual leadership" in the constitution. Over the last six years, many things have gone awry in administration and legislation and the national political scene has gone into a void, but your supporters and those who are sharing the spoils of the system attack me most frequently by saying: "Grapes that you cannot eat are always sour" and "Frustrated politician"! These vile thinkers do not know about the interactions between us:

In 2002, on the day after the election, you invited me to (1) return to the position of party chairman; (2) form a majority alliance in the National Legislature and contest for the speaker position; (3) become the chairman of the Straits Exchange Foundation after Koo Chen-fu retires. After I declined, you asked me personally again to become a political advisor. The outside world was not aware that although you and I did not meet publicly, your senior staff often ask me to consider taking this or that position. They also communicated your concern about my daughter and my financial situation.

These vile people ignore my ability to "not only endure suffering but be even stronger at resisting temptation." They also accuse you wrongly of ignoring the "former chairman"! Earlier this year, Ma Ying-jeou invited me to dinner and said with a laugh: "You always talk about national affairs. Why don't you tell me what you can accept?"

So I thank you for your continued concern over the past six years.

Perhaps I still have a sentimentality in my heart. In 2004, you were engaged in a political fight with Lian and Soong and you were obviously at a disadvantage. No matter how hard Lian and Soong tried to draw me over to their side, I refused to stab you in the back. I would rather run away to the United States than betray you and the Democratic Progressive Party.

Such was the relationship between the two of us. I have a special friendship with Big Sister Bian. Her life history has my full sympathy and her hearty character touches me. I remembered that on the night of 9/21, the past party chairmen came to make the promotional film with you and Big Sister Bian.

When Big Sister Bian saw me, she yelled out aloud: "Nori! You said that you were going to take me to a male dancing show. Why have you not fulfilled your promise!" A severely handicapped person can still be so straightforward! Today, no matter how clamorous the SOGO case has been or how shocking the national security allowance affair has been, I have never criticized Elder Sister Bian, either in private or public.

On May 25 this year, I opened the first salvo against Chao Chien-ming who has still not acknowledged to any crime: "An apology is insufficient, for Chao Chien-ming must be detained." From that day on, you and your family may be hating me. But I must tell you, I have recently been telling friends: "With respect to Elder Brother and Sister Bian, I am guilty of the sentimentality of old revolutionaries!"

This is the background by which I admitted as I started this letter: "The situation requires me to write this letter and it has been an extreme torment for me ..."

There is no need to reiterate all the things that you, I and the whole society know. At this point, in order for you to preserve yourselves, "Chao Chien-ming refused to admit to any crimes and President Chen refuses to acknowledge fault." Everybody knows that.

These facts also put the nation into an impasse without any possibility of breakthrough.

Democracy has suffered a severe setback, morality has fallen by the wayside and the national

affairs are unstable ... it is impossible to see how far the damage will go, or the day when the damage will stop.

You are smart enough to see that as long as you are in place, what future is there for the Democratic Progressive Party? What future does Taiwan have?

As long as you are in place, is there any way to win the mayoral elections in Taipei and Kaohsiung at the end of this year?

As long as you are in place, how can the 2007 legislative elections not result in huge losses?

As long as you are in place, what hope is there for the Democratic Progressive Party in the 2008 presidential election?

For the love of the Democratic Progressive Party and for the love of Taiwan, please resign!

As the storm continues to rage, you not only refused to listen to criticisms from various sectors, but you were unwilling to meet people like me who still have the sentimentality of old revolutionaries. You were willing only to take the encouragement and advice from the "Taiwan Independence big brothers" who have benefited from your authority over the past six years. You call in the "Four Heavenly Kings" who depend on your wishes and listen to their theories about concentrating central power. You "pat the heads" of the legislators and broadcast hosts who support you ... In front of you, you hear voices of support but do you know what the ordinary citizen is saying?

A few days ago, I went to shop at the food market. I heard a vegetable vendor tell the meat vendor across him: "A-Hua! Don't discard the invoices. You must pick them up and bring them to the President's Office so that he can use them for the national security expenses!"

Last night, I went to park the car and the old toll collector told me: "Old chairman! You have to tell A-Bian! It is not right that A-Ching Sao's NT\$25,000 monthly salary should be paid for by the nation!"

These are the true voices of all the common citizens who used to wave flags, cheer and support you!"

The president is the most obvious standard of morality in the nation.

The president is the physical embodiment of national sovereignty.

The president is the foundation of political stability.

When the standard is covered with dust, the body is contaminated and the foundation rock is tilting, what can the people hope for?

Elder brother A-Bian, we were wrong. After assuming power, we did not make the party better and we did not lead Taiwan to a uncorrupt society. We must be brave to acknowledge that we were wrong and we must bow and resign. If we admit our errors frankly, we will be forgiven by the people. If we continue to be obstinate and argumentative, it will only bring greater shame and retribution.

Democracy is valuable because it is not afraid of changing the steersman of the nation!

The greatest danger to a nation is when the people lose their faith and confidence!

Set a good example!

Exhibiting weakness is a virtue for the strong!

Only the truly strong can admit fault and dare to quit!

Your peaceful old warrior friend,

Shih Ming-teh.

Written on the morning of August 7, 2006.

<http://www.nori.org.tw/english/main3.asp?idno=30>

APPENDIX B

CODING SHEET

Newspaper _____

Date _____

Headline:

A. Manifest frame

a. Movement frame

Diagnostic

Prognostic

Motivational (Positive and negative)

b. Government frame

Diagnostic

Prognostic

Motivational (Positive and negative)

c. Editorial/newspaper frame

Diagnostic

Prognostic

Motivational (Positive and negative)

B. Political Opportunity (e.g., divisions among elites, etc.)

C. Political Context (e.g., foreign policy)

D. Culturally familiar symbols

E. Latent frame (e.g., interpretation/impression, key quotes, anything else notable, etc.)

APPENDIX C

SUMMARIES OF THE NEWS ARTICLES

Appendix C contains summaries from forty sampled news articles including twenty-five articles from UDN and fifteen from LT. I laid out these summaries according to the five time periods which are segmented based on the major activities of the Red Shirt movement. For each time period, the news frames that are considered significant are identified and substantiated with words or phrases excerpted from the sampled articles. Following these summaries, I discuss the changes of the news frames over the five time periods by comparing them within the same newspaper and by contrasting them between the two newspapers. These comparisons will help me answer the basic questions of my thesis.

There are six media frames discussed in this Appendix. First, the diagnostic frames point out the problem in the society and define the grievances of the people. Second, the prognostic frames provide the possible solution to the identified problem. These two frames produce a group of potential supporters for future collective actions. Third, the motivational frame encourages the pool of supporters to take action to solve the problem. Fourth, the political opportunity frame contains three subframes: urgency, agency, and possibility frames. The urgency frame conveys the activists' ideas of an urgent need for immediate action. The agency frames reveal the divisions among elites. And, the possibility frames convey the activists' vision for a better future. Incidentally, for a social movement to have open access to the mass media is in itself a political opportunity. Because through the mass media, appeals of social movements are made known to the public. Fifth, culturally familiar symbols refer to the elements which exist in people's belief system. Sixth, the latent content is the structural meaning hidden in the contextual text. In the following sections, I identify these frames in the sampled news articles for each time period and organize them according to the social actors: the Red Shirt movement, the government (the DPP and KMT), and the media (UDN and LT).

I. August 10 - September 9, 2006

This period of time was set from the first fund-raising campaign, "One Million People against Bian," to the first demonstration, "The Nazca Line."

A. Six news articles from United Daily News

I identified six media frames contained in these six news stories: diagnostic frame, prognostic frame, motivational frame, political opportunity frame, cultural familiar symbols, and latent content frames. During this time period, UDN articles largely agreed with the Red Shirt movement in its prognostic frames, motivational frames, and political opportunity frames.

a. The Red Shirt movement

UDN reported the fund-raising campaign of the Red Shirt movement, in which the movement leader, Shi Ming-teh was quoted saying that President Chen and his family were corrupt and DPP does not self-inspect. I identified this as a diagnostic frame. Corruption was the problem and President Chen, his family, and DPP were to blame. Statements by Shi that were cited by UDN include: “the one million inspired by the corruption of the president’s family” and President’s government was a greedy and corrupt group.” The articles also reported Shi’s admonition of DPP that the party should rescue itself by ousting the president and not retort that the risen oppositions were merely ethnic contentions.

UDN articles also indicated that the Red Shirt movement was a possible solution to fight against this corruption. I identified this as a prognostic frame. UDN quoted Shi Ming-teh, maintaining that in order to remove the “corrupt group”, President Chen’s resignation was necessary. Along this line, UDN reported various ways proposed by Shi to carry out the movement. For example, “supporters could go on the official website of the Red Shirt movement (www.newtaiwan.org.tw) to register for the first sit-in demonstration on September 9 and turn in \$100 NT for registration fee.” Also, the movement recruits’ statement was repeated in the article, “[It would] be a protracted war and would be twenty-four-hour around the clock,” and “during this time, the participants would take turns in the sit-in protest which would last until President Chen stepped down.”

Shi Ming-teh’s motivational rhetoric were repeated in the articles. I identify these as motivational frames. The most frequently quoted chants of Shi’s were, “participants would not

disassemble until President Chen resigns,” “the final victory will be handed to the people,” and “let the movement last for one week, one month, one year, until A-bian steps down.” These “ultimatums” were repeated in UDN articles in this time period. Also, those identified as motivational frames are the reiteration of the RedShirt movement’s goals and values which appeal strongly to the moral values of the participants and justify the social movement. For example, the article on August 29, “A-bian, step down” was used for six times in a span of seven paragraphs. The non-partisan emphasis of the Red Shirt movement was also reported by UDN articles. In the article on August 12, UDN included a quote by the movement leader saying, “... [the movement] is beyond the pan-Blue or the pan-Green but rather against corruption...It is a moral consent beyond Blue and Green...”

Lastly, UDN identified some specific culturally familiar symbols used by the Red Shirt movement. Morality and conscience were elements deeply rooted in the belief system of the Taiwanese people. The article on August 10, quoted Shi saying, “[The movement] is...the conscience of one million people enkindled by the corruption of the president’s family...It is a moral consensus beyond the pan-Blue and pan-Green.”

b. Government

UDN reported the political elites being supportive of the Red Shirt movement. I identify these messages as political opportunities because they indicated institutional influences which could be utilized by the movement.

For example, UDN article on August 14 began with” At the critical juncture when waves of anti-Bian activities arise among the pan-Green.” the chairman of KMT, Ma Ying-jeou, will unveil the results of an internal investigation into past mismanagement of party assets. Positioning himself as a candidate for the 2008 presidential election. Ma was said to “insist on serving the whole truth to the voters” at the risk of losing key party members to corruption charges. I identify these messages as political opportunities frames for the Red Shirt movement and KMT because of their resonating “anti-corruption” theme. The article on September 10

reported that, Ma, participated the sit-in demonstration on September 9 and promised to propose the second impeachment bill

c. Media

With regard to the investigation of the unreported jewelries, UDN's reporting implied strong suspicion against President Chen and his wife. This overlaps with the diagnostic frame of the Red Shirt movement. On August 25, the article headline stated that "the Control Yuan officials were inclined to believe that Bian's wife owned [the jewelries]." Five times in the article, the Control Yuan official¹ officials were said to have been "refused documentation of property" by the Presidential Office. The text also included a statement from KMT saying that the worth of the jewelries was over a million dollars and that the jewelries worn by Chen's wife at son Chen-Je's wedding were "a jade of extreme high quality."

Moreover, UDN articles frequently repeated statements from the movement leader and recruits. I identified this as a political opportunity frame because by the large amount of space UDN gave the movement, UDN in effect became an organizing resource for the movement. Specifically, in one of the articles, the exact statement of the movement organizers was quoted: The statements were: "There would be a twenty-four-hour sit-in demonstration in front of the Presidential Office on September 9." In the same article, the date, "September 9," was repeated for six times; the sit-in site "Ketagalan Boulevard" was mentioned five times; and "sit-in demonstrations" was used twelve times. Often, the news frames almost fully overlapped with the movement frames. For instance, on August 12, the press release of the movement organization took up five paragraphs out of an article of seven paragraphs; on August 29, Shi Ming-teh was quoted six times, which occupied two thirds of the length of the article. Moreover, there were agency frames, a subframe of political opportunity frames. Shi Ming-teh was found saying "[The movement participants are] making history by fighting against corruption in this critical moment." Finally, another important element of the political frames is the coverage talking about the impeachment bill against President Chen and the bill of demanding resignation

of the cabinet. UDN said that these bills were about to be brought up in the congress to imply the opportunity for the Red Shirt movement within the political institution.

B. Two news articles from Liberty Times

Counterframes are identified in LT articles in the first period, focusing on the low legitimacy of the Red Shirt movement.

a. Media

On August 25, LT covered a violent incident occurred between one of the movement organizers, Lin Chen-jei, and a political analyst, Jin Hen-wei. It was countered to the motivational frame of the Red Shirt movement, lowering its legitimacy. LT stressed that Lin attacked after Jin criticized the Red Shirt movement of illegal and illegitimate. An interview with Jin pointed out that, although the movement claimed to be peaceful and nonviolent, there would be people like Lin who wanted to solve problems by violence and Shi Ming-teh would have to be responsible for the cost. This article had twelve paragraphs, the term “violence” was repeated seven times and “depose bian” was recorded six times.

b. Latent content

LT pointed out the different stands of Lin and Jin and thus predicted conflicts which took place between those who supported and deposed Chen Shui-bian. Lin was said to be “supporting Shi and deposing Bian” (挺施倒扁) and Jin was “supporting Bian” (挺扁). This is a counterframe against the motivational frame of the Red Shirt movement. LT reported that Lin’s violent conduct was his reaction to Jin’s criticism on the low legitimacy and legality of the Red Shirt movement. However, Lin said that the main reason was because Jin interrupted his speaking.

LT stated that the activities and demonstrations held by the Red Shirt movement organization had low legitimacy, countering to the motivational frames. On August 18, LT reported that the twenty-four-hour around o’clock sit-in demonstrations coming up on September 9 was illegal and violated the Assembly and Parade law since, according to the law,

the public gatherings should end before ten o'clock at night. The mayor of Taipei City Ma Ying-jeou was said to "favor" and "makes exceptions" for the movement organization that he allowed the demonstrations would last all day for twenty-six days. Ma was said to have "double standards" for the Red Shirt movement and the protests in the past. In 2004, the pan-Blue supporters protested against Chen's re-election¹⁰ in front of the Presidential Palace and were expelled after ten o'clock. Furthermore, LT implied that Mayor Ma's approval on the twenty-four-hour event was out of his own political interests and thus compromised after Shi stated that a social movement should not be a nine-to-five mission.

II. September 10 to September 15, 2006

A. Five news articles from United Daily News

The second movement activity, "Encircling the City", was brought forth on September 15. In this time period, UDN covered the diagnostic frame, motivational frames, and political opportunity frames overlapping with the ones of the Red Shirt movement.

a. The Red Shirt Movement

First, UDN included diagnostic frames by quoting the movement leader, Shi Ming-teh. UDN quoted Shi Ming-teh describing President Chen's government a "corrupt regime" as well as making wrong decisions in policies. He also said that it deserved to be overthrown.

Second, UDN laid out the prognostic frames by covering the strategies and means which proclaimed by the movement leader. Shi was reported appealing the other significant political figures to urge President Chen to step down and to come up with a plan for the political circumstances. In short, the political elites ought to take actions as one of the remedies to the problem.

Third, UDN contained motivational frames which helped mobilize movement participants. These frames were constantly carried out by quoting the motivating words from

¹⁰ It was the "319 protest."

Shi Ming-teh. Shi was quoted in the article on September 14, the day before 915 protest, addressing that “I and one million people consent on (期約) a demonstration of ‘love and peace to depose Bian’” and “[We] hope that all the Taiwanese people come to this demonstration.” The term “consent on” and “come” were motivating and these two sentences were repeated two times respectively. In addition, on September 15, the news story said that Shi’s maintained, “The victory of this war will be given to the people” and “President Chen can hardly withstand [for any longer].” In elsewhere, I found that Shi stated “If Chen does not resign, the participants will not leave” and “This war will not come to the end until A-bian step down.” These words predicted a positive outcome of the demonstration. Moreover, UDN justified the 915 demonstration by quoting Shi saying that the 915 protest was a response to the 916 protest mobilized by DPP. Furthermore, the Red Shirt movement was said to gather more participants and thus become more powerful. I identify this as a motivational frame because popularity of a social movement validates its existence and legitimacy. One of the quotations from Shi stood out in illustrating this point, “Taiwanese people’s power of fighting corruption had become stronger and stronger and eventually, it will crush the Presidential Palace.” The other motivating element found in this time period was Shi’s claiming a peaceful and nonviolent protest on September 15. The quotes from Shi were used in the headlines both on September 14 and 15 stressing peace and nonviolence.

Finally, elements of the political opportunity frames could be found in UDN stories in this time period. First, the agency frame pointed out the divisions among the political elites, specifically, Chen was said to be isolated by his party members. The movement leader was cited declaring that “Although Chen does not care about the people, there were members in DPP caring for the perceptions of the society toward the party and the government, economic future, and DPP’s future;” “Chen’s party members were unwilling to stand with President Chen, which was proved by their not participating the 916 protest mobilized by DPP to encourage President Chen and the pan-Green supporters. Moreover, a possibility frame was covered on

September 15. UDN covered Shi's making public the following movement activities, which was to initiate Depose Bian movement throughout Taiwan island and then to surround Presidential Palace to topple down Chen's regime. This coverage was considered a possibility frame because it gave a successful prediction of the movement.

b. Government

The factors of the motivational frames and political opportunity frames were the support from the pan-Blue political elites. On October 10, UDN reported that the KMT chairman, Ma Ying-jeou, and the PFP chairman, James Soong, participated in the sit-in demonstration on September 9. In their interviews by the media, Ma was said to suggest the Congress to propose a second impeachment bill against President Chen; James Soong agreed and said that final decision of Chen's staying in office or not should be left to the Taiwanese people. Moreover, the impeachment bill was brought up later again on September 12, UDN said that the KMT and PFP both promoted the second impeachment bill in the congress.

c. Media

UDN promoted motivational frames which helped the mobilization of the Red Shirt movement. First, UDN gave positive description of the protest, "Encircling the City", on September 9. The headline of the story on September 10 said, "The red fire of deposing bian wrote [a page in] history," corresponding to the movement leader's encouraging his supporters to be the agent of their own history. UDN conveyed a popular image of the Red Shirt movement. There were lines saying "tens of thousands of people...showed their passion in deposing bian...shouting 'A-bian, step down.'" The term "A-bian step down" was used four times in the text and this appeal was said to "rend the skies."

UDN became a communication tool for the Red Shirt movement, transmitting movement messages to the public. I consider this a political opportunity frame because through spreading of the movement information, UDN validated the significance of the Red Shirt movement and garnered institutional support from social and political elites. First, UDN articles

contained movement information such as when, where, how, and what. On September 10, the day after the first movement activity, UDN reported that the sit-in demonstration in front of Presidential Palace would last for twenty-four hours every day until September 15. There were also stories on September 14 and 15 reporting the coming of the second movement activity, "Besiege." Additionally, sometimes the UDN news frames fully overlapped with the movement frames. For example, the news on September 12 said that Shi Ming-teh was said to ask six important political elites, Ma Ying-jeou, Wang Jing-pin, Lien Chen, James Soong, Annette Lu, and Li Ten-hui to exhort the president to step down. There were eight paragraphs in the context where Shi was cited ten times; a quote from Shi was included in the headline. Moreover, on September 14, in a text of eight paragraphs, Shi was quoted five times; the term "depose bian" was used seven times; and "Besiege" was mentioned four times. On September 15, Shi was cited for five times and the word "Besiege" was repeated six times in a content of seven paragraphs.

UDN gave the readers a negative impression of the government. The chairman of DPP, Yu Shyi-Kun, was reported to give a speech in New York blaming Shi Ming-teh and the Depose Bian movement. Specifically, UDN used three quotations from Yu saying the rain on September 9 was a sign that Heaven was helping President Chen. Shi Ming-teh and the other movement organizers were reported to reply saying that, as the chairman of the incumbent political party, Yu was coldhearted.

B. Three news articles Liberty Times

Counterframes were prominent in LT over this study period. First, the LT adopted the frames of the government which degraded the motivational and political opportunity frames for the movement. Second, the news frames countered to the motivational frames of the Red Shirt movement, denouncing the movement as bringing high social costs and division to the society.

a. Government

The high-ranking officials from the government were cited to counter the motivational frames and political opportunity frames. First, these counterframes emphasized the constraints of improving the society by means of the Red Shirt movement. The Red Shirt movement was harmful to the economy, having positive contribution to the society. Executive Yuan Minister, Su Jen-Chang, said that the speeches released by the movement participants resulted into social division...and even to an extent considering “We are right and you are not”; social stability which was jeopardized by the Red Shirt movement was the most significant prerequisite for Taiwan’s prospect development both at present and in the future (LT, September 15). In addition, the former president, the spiritual leader of TSU, Lee Ten-hui, also was cited saying that the movement caused divisions within the society and tore it apart. Second, the Red Shirt movement was considered an extrainstitutional and unconstitutional chaos, being unable to obtain institutional influence. Lee Ten-hui was quoted saying, “Social movement cannot replace democracy and the rule of law” (LT, September 15).

b. Media

The news frames of LT focused on the negative results resulted from the Red Shirt movement, which were opposite to the motivational frames of the movement. LT reported that the planned strike in October was evaluated as being harmful to the long-term economic development of Taiwan. The news story said that the strike would cause a daily loss of three hundred millions NT in GNP, leading to the collapse of Taiwan’s economy (LT, September 12). Hence, both Premier Su and Mayor Ma were said to disagree with the idea of initiating a strike. Furthermore, LT said that the Red Shirt movement caused high social costs, both for now and future. There were violent incidents, traffic chaos, noises, and confrontations between Chen’s supporters and the movement participants.

LT included motivational frames for the 916 protest in the article on September 15. The demonstration was said to be held by a club, Taiwan Society. Its representative stated that the

916 protest was for the Taiwanese people to declare their real color and voice but not to counter Shi's Red Shirt movement or to contend for Chen Shui-bian.

c. Latent Content

Although LT covered the motivational frame of the Red Shirt movement, the main idea conveyed was to convey to the readers the high social costs which were likely to be brought forth. The mentioning of the planned strike in October and other social disturbances indicated that the Red Shirt movement should end before more destruction took place. Besides, the coverage of the 916 protest implied that the Red Shirt movement did not represent the public opinion, at least not all the people in Taiwan. President Chen still had many supporters, being legitimate to stay in office.

III. September 16 to September 29, 2006

A. Four new articles from United Daily News

The third movement activity, "Blossom Everywhere," was brought forth on September 29. The news articles in third time period contained diagnostic frames, motivational frames, and political opportunity frames. Besides, counterframes began appearing in this time period.

a. The Red Shirt Movement:

The indicators of the motivational frames used by UDN were the speeches of the movement leader. To paint a positive picture of the activity result on September 16, UDN covered Shi Ming-teh maintaining that people's power was able to overthrow the corrupt government as well as to defend democracy, freedom, human rights, and authority of the country. This quote was taken from Shi's address to the movement participants after the 915 demonstration was claimed to be victorious.

b. Government

UDN stressed the low legitimacy of President Chen by reporting criticisms against him. I identify this as a motivational frame. The former President, Lee Ten-hui, was quoted criticizing the DPP government as incapable of reigning the country because it mobilized the

countermovement, the 916 protest. “The government should comfort the [movement participants]” and responding them with improvement; the government should not indulge the enmity between Chen’s supporters and the movement supporters, Lee said (UDN, September 24). Moreover, Lee added that people protested against the president because they expected a political environment without corruption.

c. Media

UDN took sides with the Red Shirt movement in its diagnostic frame by depicting President Chen as corrupt. On September 23, President Chen Shui-bian and his wife Wu Shuchen were reported to be engaged in the embezzlement of the government funds which were apportioned for secret foreign affairs by using fake receipts. UDN said that the president and the first lady were reported to be suspected of forgery and also, the evidences of which might bring charges against Chen and his wife of embezzling the secret diplomatic fund.

UDN contained motivational frames by conveying a successful image of the 915 protest and covering Shi Ming-teh vocabularies of motive. First, the story on September 16 came with a headline claiming that “Tens of thousands of Red Shirt Army won the victory peacefully.” The terms such as “Red Shirt Army,” “victory,” and “peace” were used in the article. They showed that the news frames overlapped with the ones of the movement. Second, UDN said that “the command-in-chief of Besiege Shi Ming-teh kneeled upon his knees to thank Heaven and the participants after the protest was considered successful.” Shi was quoted saying “...this is Taiwanese people’s victory,” “The Taiwanese people declared to the whole world that we are able to uproot corruption...” (UDN, September 16).

By reporting a violent attack on the movement participants by the supporters of President Chen in Kaohsiung City (a city in the southern part of Taiwan), UDN endorse more legitimacy on the Red Shirt movement. This element is also identified as a motivational frame. The news presented Chen’s supporters as violent. In the article on September 19, they were said to attack the movement participants with water balloons, rocks, and water bottles. “Chen’s

supporters surrounded the demonstrators...” and “The reporters, the policemen, the sit-in demonstrators were hurt by the rocks...” UDN reported.

Furthermore, during this time period, UDN was a communication channel for the Red Shirt movement. The UDN article on September 16 was considered a press release from the Red Shirt movement organization. Except for presenting a popular and victorious image of the movement, Shi was quoted for five times in a short text of six paragraphs. I identify this as a political opportunity frame because through this way, UDN validated Shi Ming-teh as a significant figure and conveyed positive information concerning the Red Shirt movement to the readers.

d. Counterframes

The counterframe of UDN appeared for the first time in this time period, stressing the social costs resulting from the Red Shirt movement. First, UDN reported that there were conflicts between the president’s supporters and opponents. The movement participants were attacked by Chen’s supporters in other localities other than Taipei City, which led to more resentment among the people. UDN began the story on September 24 by saying “Movement supporters and Chen’s supporters instigated social confrontations.” In addition, Lee Ten-Hui was quoted saying: “All the disputes need to be solved according to the principles of democracy and the rule of law...It should not be like a revolution...[I] hope the deposed demonstrators exercise their self-constraints.” He also stressed that the Red Shirt movement as an extrainstitutional movement would not attain a goal of democracy.

B. Four news articles from Liberty Times

In this study period, the news frames of LT covered both motivational frames of and counterframes against the Red Shirt movement. The positive image of the Red Shirt movement appeared for the first time on LT. It also included the motivational frames for the 916 protest.

a. The Red Shirt Movement

First, LT reported the 915 protest, the second demonstration of the Red Shirt movement, as successful. It quoted Shi Ming-teh's declaration of the success of the protest, saying that the protest as Taiwanese people's power was able to overthrow a corrupt ruler as well as defend freedom, democracy, human rights, and authority. The 915 demonstration was described as "massive" and "the streets were crowded with people." The numbers of participants were also reported: the social movement organization said there were over millions of demonstrators and Taipei City Police Station said that there were three hundred and sixty participants.

b. Government

LT repeatedly stated that the Red Shirt movement caused social costs, as one of the indicators of the counterframes to the motivational frames. LT said that the Red Shirt movement caused disturbances which influenced the public security. The news story on September 21 reported that the National Police Agency (NPA) stated that the Red Shirt movement and the 916 demonstration exhausted the police and it might influence the public security. LT also quoted from the candidate of the mayor of Taipei City, Frank Hsieh (謝長廷): "Ma Ying-jeou should have evaluated the capacity before approving the movement activities and he should be responsible for the public security after giving approval to the movement."

Second, LT quoted from the DPP party members stating that there were evidences showing that the movement activity, Blossom Everywhere, was mobilized by the local agencies of KMT in different provinces and cities. This is another countering effort to Shi's claiming this movement as being neutral politically. The mobilization of the pan-Blue supporters to join in the demonstrations was contrary to what the motivational frames of the movement in declaring that it was neutral in the political stand and the participants were self-mobilized.

Third, LT repeatedly covered DPP's reiteration of its negative point of view and its stand toward the Red Shirt movement. I consider it as a counterframe to the motivational frames. DPP members were reported addressing, "DPP upholds democracy and the rule of law,

disapproved violence, and all the fellow members should not participate in any kind of violent movement activities (LT, September 21). Additionally, a DPP legislator, Lai Qing-de, was cited talking to Shi Ming-teh through LT, “A responsible politician should consider the impacts and costs of a social movement...All the criticisms toward the government, toward the president, and toward the current political situation should be solved in Congress lest the social movement results in more social costs” (LT, September 21).

Finally, the motivational frames for the 916 protest were covered. LT reported that the “Love, Hope, Light of Taiwan” assembly (also known as the 916 Protest) was carried out on the Ketagalan Boulevard in front of the Presidential Office on September 16 to encourage Chen Shui-bian. It said that many participants from other provinces, high-rank officials, and DPP members participate in the gathering.

c. Latent Content

Although the initiator of “Love, Hope, Light of Taiwan” demonstration said that this protest was not to react to Shi Ming-teh or to express their support to Chen. LT presented a different point of view. LT said that the pan-Green supporters and people who oppose to the Red Shirt movement were upset ever since Shi Ming-teh initiated the movement; the 916 protest was said to release the grievances resulted from the deposed Chen movement (LT, September 17). Furthermore, the chairman of DPP was quoted stressing that “Taiwan will not be defeated by the Red terror” (LT, September 17). Through this, LT enhanced the legitimacy of the 916 protest by presenting it a reaction to the Red Shirt movement. This is also identified as counterframes in contrast to the agency frame proposed by the Red Shirt movement. LT said that President Chen still had supporters and political allies by pointing out their participation, indicating that Chen was not isolated.

LT covered an accusation of corruption against Ma Ying-jeou by the legislators from the DPP, Hsieh Hsin-ni. Hsieh was said to accuse Ma Ying-jeou of embezzling “Special Expense” as “Special Allowance” and used the money for personal expenses. This story reduced the

legitimacy of Ma's aligning his stand with the anticorruption movement. Furthermore, there were seven paragraphs in this article and Ma's using the governmental funds for personal use was mentioned seven times.

Although there was a positive description of the success of the 915, it was followed by quotations from the spokesman from the Executive Yuan and his appeal to the movement participants of going back to normal life. LT implied that the Red Shirt movement should be disbanded. Additionally, the movement organizers were cited saying "The power of these participants actually could have been turned to destructive behaviors...the government should consider wisely what to do" (LT, September 16). The headline of this story was laid out "the protest was peaceful" and yet, LT used a threatening quote from the movement organizers.

IV. September 30 to October 10, 2006

A. Six news articles United Daily News

The final movement demonstration, "Besiege," took place on October 10, Taiwan's National Day. In this time period, the identified frames included diagnostic frames, motivational frames, political opportunity frames, and counterframes.

a. Media

UDN continue to cover the investigation progress of the embezzlement allegation against President Chen and the first lady, Wu Shu-chen. I consider this as overlapping with the diagnostic frame of the Red Shirt movement. On October 2, the headline of UDN article used "a wanted confederate" to describe the tenuous position of the president and the first lady as being likely to be proven corrupt. In the text, not only the term "a wanted confederate" was used for five times to indicate Chen's involvement in the case but also said that "So far, according to facts uncovered by the Corruption Investigation Center plus the President's admission on forging fake administrative expense receipts, it can almost be certain that the President and key personnel involved in the approval of administrative expenses are involved in forgery."

Additionally, UDN contained the positive result of “Blossom Everywhere” on October 8 and vocabularies of motive on October 10. These are identified as the motivational frames. First, the news stories presented the Red Shirt movement as prevailing, popular, and powerful. UDN reported that Shi Ming-teh led over five hundred participants to tour Taiwan on buses to declare the movement goal and values for one week. UDN said that in the provinces and cities that the “Red Shirt Army” passed through, there were people, including local government officials, responding to the values and welcoming Shi and his followers.

Second, on October 10, UDN covered the fourth movement activity, “Besiege”, which was going to bring forth on that day. Emboldened by the popularity, Shi was said to urge Chen Shui-bian to step down. UDN quoted Shi both in the headline and news text indicating that if President Chen did not respond to their appeals, he and the participants would continue to occupy the streets until their goal was achieved. Responding to Shi, UDN adopted President Chen’s address stating that, “Other people can use extrainstitutional means to fulfill political objective and yet, as a president, my job was to defend the Constitution and maintain the social and national stability. Keep the Constitution is the highest responsibility endowed to a president.” On top of this, he also said that the impeachment bill was another product of political struggles between the ruling party and opposition.

Moreover, UDN continued to be a mobilization tool for the Red Shirt movement. I identify this as a political opportunity frame. First, UDN began the article on October 10 by saying “The depose bian [movement] organization called two million people to besiege [Taipei] City on National Day.” The content also conveyed the information of the demonstration, including when and where. Besides, the news said that Besiege was the “high peak” of the Red Shirt movement. I identify this as a political opportunity frame because UDN was considered an information channel for the movement. Second, UDN mentioned the institutional means of influence. It said, “The legislators would vote on the impeachment bill against President Chen on October 13 and in the meanwhile, the depose bian movement organization lunched an

impeachment against the legislators to put pressure on the DPP legislators,” implying the possibility of ousting the president by the bill.

b. Counterframes

UDN said that the Red Shirt movement resulted in a higher party rift between the pan-Blue and pan-Green coalitions. The KMT candidate campaigning for the mayor of Kaohsiung City, Huang Jun-ying, was said to lose six percent of supporting rate because the disturbances caused by the deposed movement.

c. Latent Content

During this time period, UDN covered positive and negative frames of the Red Shirt movement. First, UDN covered the news story saying that President Chen was likely to be proved corrupt legitimized the Red Shirt movement. Second, UDN validated the Red Shirt movement by covering the movement development such as the first and last day of “Blossom Everywhere.” Yet, UDN also revealed that the conflicts, divisions, and rifts which were made severer by the movement. On October 2, a menacing incident confronted by the movement participants was covered. This news story implied that Chen’s supporters were violent and there were repeated conflicts between Chen’s supporters and the movement participants.

B. Two news articles from Liberty Times

During this time, LT had counterframe to the diagnostic frames proposed by the Red Shirt movement.

a. Government

LT reported that President Shui-bian Chen and his wife Shu-chen Wu were innocent in the corruption allegations. This is contrary to the diagnostic frame. LT said that Wu was once accused of receiving gift certificates from a department store chain and involved in seeking the government’s permission in its transition of management. However, there was not enough evidence to prosecute Wu, so she was cleared. In addition, the recent accusations involved President Chen and his wife of embezzling the secret diplomatic funds were still under the

judiciary inquiry conducted by the Taiwan's High Court. The prosecutor was cited promising that he would conclude the investigation in mid-October. On October 10, the spokesman of the Presidential Office was said to declare that the investigation process looked optimistic for President Chen and the first lady; "the people of Taiwan should have more trust in their judiciary system" he said.

b. Latent Content

Although the Red Shirt movement leader and organizers depicted the the government as incapable, irresponsible, and dysfunctional, LT countered to these negative accusations with the progressing of the investigation on Chen's corrupt allegation. It pointed out that the pages of the statement of charges and the numbers of people summoned to court far exceeded the cases in the past, implying the prosecutor's being cautious. The stories on October 2 and October 3 both implicitly conveyed a positive image of the judiciary system, of President Chen and of the first lady.

V. After October 10, 2006

A. Four news articles from United Daily News

After the last movement protest, Besiege, on October 10, the counterframes contained UDN against the Red Shirt movement became more apparent. The news in this period focused on the decreasing legitimacy of that Red Shirt movement and the closing of the political opportunity. However, there were still diagnostic frames against President Chen.

a. Media

UDN depicted a negative picture of the movement activity, "Besiege." This was the first time a news story in UDN criticized the movement activity. I identify it as countering to motivational frames and political frames. On October 11, the article was started with this sentence: "The worst birthday of the Republic of China." In the following content, UDN said that the PFP chairman led the pan-Blue legislators to "depose bian" in the National Ceremony, including shouting "A-bian, step down" when President Chen was giving a speech. Additionally,

there were violent conflicts involved by the pan-Blue, “deposing-Bian” legislators and the pan-Green legislators during the National Day Parade in front of all the foreign guests. Moreover, other than the chaos in the National Ceremony, the “illegal” movement rallies occupied the main traffic line in the busiest business district. The movement organization asked the participants to sit down on the busiest street until the next day.

Moreover, UDN presented the impossibility for the Red Shirt movement to influence the investigation result of the allegations against President Chen on embezzling the national funds. It is considered a counterframe to the motivational frames, being in contrast to the efficiency of the movement. On October 13, one of the organizers was quoted saying that “The defining moment for the battle to topple Bian is not besieging of the city on September 15 or Besiege on October 10. Instead, it is at the unveiling of the final results from the investigation of the administrative expense case.” UDN quoted from the prosecutor, Eric Chen, responding to the movement organizers that “My defining moment depends on evidences but not on people’s power.”

Furthermore, UDN reported that the second impeachment bill failed to pass in the legislature because of the lack of vote. This is identified a counterframe in contrast to the political opportunity frames, signifying that the Red Shirt movement lost its institutional influence. The opposition parties, the KMT and the PFP, had different opinions on what to do in their next steps: the KMT suggested proposing another impeachment bill and the PFP was going to promote a bill to demand for the resignation of the cabinet. However, UDN said that both proposals were not acceptable to the people by presenting a poll to the readers on October 15. It showed that over fifty percent of the people did not agree with the third recall motion or the resignation of the cabinet; Chen’s approval rating had increased from twenty-six percent to thirty-two percent.

B. Four news articles from Liberty Times

During this time period, LT contained counterframes which counter to the motivational frames and political opportunity frames of the Red Shirt movement.

a. Government

LT said that there were divisions within the pan-Blue camp, which made it impossible to impeach President Chen. It is identified as an end to the political opportunity because the impeach bill was destined to fail without the cooperation of the KMT and PFP. Premier, Su Tseng-chang and KMT chairman, Ma Ying-jeou urged the legislators to let the Congress operate normally by promoting no more impeachment bills. Ma was quoted suggesting that the movement supporters should calm down and wait for the investigation result of the judiciary system. Also, LT said that Ma and the KMT legislators refused to sign on the divisive bill calling for the resignation of the cabinet proposed by the PFP. Later, the PFP joined with the DPP on passing the bill on auditing the party assets of the KMT.

b. Media

LT contained the indicators of the counterframes, including causing traffic chaos, violating the law, and defying the rules. These are considered a counterframe to the motivational frames, presenting the low legitimacy of the Red Shirt movement. On October 11, LT reported that the deposed movement organization initiated "Besiege" without any approval from the law-enforcement agency, violating the law. The demonstrators illegally occupied the main traffic line and paralyzed the traffic by holding sit-in on the street. Additionally, the demonstrators defied the rules by ignoring the warnings given by the police. In this article, within the text composed of five paragraphs, the traffic chaos was repeated seven times, the violation of the law was mentioned seven times, and the defiance of the rule was used four times.

Besides, LT indicated that the Red Shirt movement lost support of significant political elite. This indicator of the counterframe is contrary to the political opportunity. On October 11, LT reported that since Mayor Ma approved the movement activities regardless its negative

impacts on social stability, he should be responsible for all the violations and disturbances resulted from the movement. In the article composed of five paragraphs, the blames on Ma was found in four places. Later on October 13, Ma was said to be “upset” with the demonstrators’ violations against the law on October 10, saying that Shi did not keep his promise in maintaining peace and nonviolence. It resulted in Taipei City Police Department’s cancellation of the approval of the following movement activities. In other words, the movement organization could no more legally hold public demonstrations after October 13.

III. Latent content

The Red Shirt movement lost its legality in holding more demonstrations. It also lost the support of Mayor Ma, which means it lost the best access to obtain institutional impact.

APPENDIX D

COMPARISONS OF UDN AND LT ARTICLES

	August 10 ~ September 9 Nasca Line (300,000 or more 90,000 people)		
	UDN	LT	Details/ Key words and terms
Diagnostic frame	1		A. President Chen was corrupt.
Prognostic Frame	1		A. The Red Shirt movement was a possible solution.
Motivational Frame	5		A. Shi Mingt-teh's vocabularies of motive: "The victory will be handed to the people," "Let the movement last until Chen steps down" and "The participants were making history." B. The reiteration of movement goals and values: A-bian step down and anticorruption. C. The Red Shirt movement was politically neutral. D. The positive outcomes of Nazca Line E. A negative image of the government. F. Mayor Ma's endorsement.
Cultural familiar element	1		A. Morality and conscience
political opportunity	2		A. UDN became a mobilizational tool for the Red Shirt movement B. The mention of impeachment bill against President Chen.
Counterframe		2	A. The Red Shirt movement had low legitimacy: being illegal B. The Red Shirt movement caused social costs: violences, noises
Latent content			A. The prediction of conflicts between Chen's supporters and movement supporters.

September 10 ~ September 15
Encircling the City (750,000 or 360,000 people)

			Details
	UDN	LT	
Diagnostic frame	1		A. Chen's government was a corrupt regime.
Prognostic Frame	1		A. The political elites should urge Chen to step down.
Motivational Frame	5		A. Shi Ming-teh's vocabularies of motive: Don't miss the significant turning point of the history, the victory will be given to the people, we will not leave until Chen Shui-bian step down, and peace and nonviolence of the demonstration. B. The popularity of the Red Shirt movement. C. The positive outcome of Nasca Line and positive predictions of Encircling the City. D. The negative image of the government. E. The endoresement of KMT chairman Ma Ying-jeou and PFP chairman James Soong.
Cultural familiar element			
political opportunity	5		A. President Chen was isolated by the DPP members. B. It was said to be the right time to oust Chen Shui-bian C. If the new generation in DPP who were born in the 60s and 70s, they can bring hope to DPP. D. KMT and PFP promoted the impeachment bill in Congress. E. Movement information: when, wheren, how, and what.
Counterframe		4	A. The Red Shirt movement caused social costs (being harmful to the economy, deepening the social division, violent incidents, traffic chaos, nosies, and confrontations between Chen's supporters and movement supporters). B. The Red Shirt movement was outside the realm of democracy and the rule of law. C. The planned strke would cause a economic collapse. D. Information of the 916 protest.
Latent content			A. The coverage of the 916 protest implied that the Red Shirt movement did not represent all the Taiwanese people's opinion.

	Spetember 16 ~ September 30 Bolossom Everywhere (More than 500 people)		
	UDN	LT	Details
Diagnostic frame	1		A. President Chen was corrupt. B. A negative image of the government.
Prognostic Frame			
Motivational Frame	4		A. Shi Ming-teh's speech which contained vocabularies of motive: B. A negative image of the government. C. A positive result of Encircling the City. D. Chen's supporters were the origins of violence.
Cultural familiar element			
political opportunity	1		A. UDN became an organizational resource of the Red Shirt movement.
Counterframe		6	A. The Red Shirt movement was out of the realm of democracy and the rule of law; the problem should be solved through Congress. B. The Red Shirt movement caused social costs (social confrontations, social disturbances, and influencing public security) C. The Red Shirt movement was partisan D. The positive outcome of the 916 protest. E. Mayor Ma, as a supporter of the Red Shirt movement, was corrupt himself. F. The Red Shirt movement should be disbanded, allowing the people to go back to normal life.
Latent content		2	A. The 916 protest proved that President Chen still had many supporters and political elites. B. It was a provocation to go to other provinces or cities except for Taipei to depose bian.

	October 1 ~ October 10 Besiege (1500,000 or 124,000 people)		
	UD N	L T	Details
Diagnostic frame	1		A. President Chen was corrupt.
Prognostic Frame			
Motivational Frame	2		A. The positive outcomes of Blossom Everywhere. B. Shi Ming-teh's vocabularies of motive.
Cultural familiar element			
political opportunity	2		A. UDN became an organizational tool for the Red Shirt movement. B. The mention of the impeachment bill against President Chen.
Counterframe	2	1	A. The Red Shirt movement as unconstitutional. B. The Red Shirt movement caused a higher party rift. C. President Chen and the first lady were clean.
Latent content			A. President Chen's supporters were the origins of violence.

	October 11~		
	UDN	LT	Details
Diagnostic frame			
Prognostic Frame			
Motivational Frame			
Cultural familiar element			
political opportunity			
Counterframe		8	<p>A. A negative reporte on Besiege: the pan-Blue legislators' disrespect to President Chen, the interruption in the National Parade in front of the foreign guests, and the holding illegal demonstrations.</p> <p>B. The Red Shirt movement had low legitimacy.</p> <p>C. The Red Shirt movement was unable to influce the judiciary investigation.</p> <p>D. The fail of the second impeachment bill against Chen.</p> <p>E. The Red Shirt movement caused social costs (traffic chaos, violating the law, defying the rules,)</p> <p>F. The division between KMT and PFP.</p> <p>G. The Red Shirt mvoement lost support from political elites.</p> <p>H. Chen Shui-bian's approval rate went up.</p>

REFERENCES

- Babbie, Earl. 2007. *The Practice of Social Research*, 11th ed. Belmont, CA: Thomson Higher Education.
- Benford, Robert D. 1987. *Framing Activity, Meaning and Social Movement Participation: The Nuclear Disarmament Movement*. Unpublished Ph. D. dissertation, University of Texas-Austin.
- Benford, Robert D. 1993. "'You Could Be the Hundredth Monkey': Collective Action Frames and Vocabularies of Motive within the Nuclear Disarmament Movement." *The Sociological Quarterly*, 34(2): 195-216.
- Benford, Robert D. and David A. Snow. 2000. "Framing Process and Social Movements: An Overview and Assessment." *Annual Review of Sociology*, 26: 611-639.
- Berg, Bruce L. 2004. *Qualitative Research Methods: For the Social Sciences*, 5th ed. Pearson Education.
- Bradsher, Kieth. 2004. "Politicians in Taiwan Quarreling Over Recount." *The New York Times*, March 22. Retrieved March 20, 2010 (<http://www.nytimes.com/2004/03/22/world/politicians-in-taiwan-quarreling-over-recount.html>)
- Chen, Kuan-hsin. 2007. "Taiwan's red movement: An introduction." *Inter-Asia Studies* 8(1).
- Chen, Yu-jen. 2008. *2006 Anti-President Chen Shui-bian Movement's Strategy*. Unpublished Master thesis, National Taiwan University.
- Chiang, Weng-tsung. 2008. *On the Theory of the Justification of Civil Disobedience and Its Practice*. Unpublished Master thesis, National Taipei University.

- Choi, Hyeon C. and Samuel L. Becker. 1987. "Media Use, Issue/Image Discriminations, and Voting." *Communication Research*, 14(3): 267-290.
- Entman, Robert M.. 1993. "Framing: Toward Clarification of a Fractured Paradigm." *Journal of Communication*, 43(4): 51-58.
- Fang, Shou-ming. 2007. *The Study of External Strategy of Social Movement in Taiwan's Democratization*. Unpublished Master thesis, National Chengchi University.
- Feng, Guo-chen. 2007. *The Agenda Building and Framing Strategies of "Anti-Corruption Depose-Chen Campaign"*. Unpublished Master thesis, Shi-Hsin University.
- Gamson, William A. 1988. "Political Discourse and Collective Action." *International Social Movement Research*, 1: 219-244.
- Gamson, William A. and Andre Modigliani. 1989. "Media Discourse and Public Opinion on Nuclear Power: A Constructionist Approach." *The American Journal of Sociology*, 95(1): 1-37. Retrieved April 22, 2009 (<http://www.jstor.org/stable/2780405>)
- Gamson, William A. and Gadi Wolfsfeld. 1993. "Movements and Media as Interacting Systems." *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 528: 114-125. Retrieved April 7, 2009 (<http://www.jstor.org/stable/1047795>)
- Gamson, William A. and David S. Meyer. 1996. "Framing Political Opportunity." Pp. 274-290 in *Comparative Perspectives on Social Movements: Political Opportunities, Mobilizing Structures and Social Framings*, edited by D. McAdam, John D. McCarthy and Mayer Zald. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gitlin, Todd. 1980. *The Whole World is Watching: Mass media in the Making and Unmaking of the New Left*. Berkley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press.
- Goffman, Erving. 1974. *Frame Analysis*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Green, Donald, Bradley Palmquist, and Eric Schickler. 2002. *Partisan Hearts and Minds:*

- Political Parties and the Social Identity of Voters*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Hong, Cai-can. 2006. "A Study of Press Image of the Candidates in 2006 Taipei Mayoral Campaign—United Daily News and Liberty Times." *E-Society Journal*. Retrieved January 29, 2010 (<http://mail.nhu.edu.tw/~society/e-j/66/66-05.htm>)
- Hong, Caroline. 2005. "KMT Backs Second 319 Committee." *Taipei Times*, March 20. Retrieved March 20, 2010 (<http://www.taipetimes.com/News/front/archives/2005/03/20/2003246983>)
- Huang, Fu-chi. 2007. "The Red Tide's Resurgence: Next Month, from 7th Through 9th on Ketagalan Boulevard." United Daily News, August 14. Retrieved February 2, 2010 (<http://tw.myblog.yahoo.com/janetjaja/article>).
- Iyengar, Shanto and Donald R. Kinder. 1987. *News That Matters: Television and American Opinion*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Hsiao, Yi-ching. 2006. "Changes in Demographic Characteristics and Political Attitudes of Newspaper Readers in Taiwan: 1992~2004." *Taiwan Democratic Journal*, 3(4): 37-70.
- Kielbowicz, Rechar B. and Clifford Scherer. 1986. "The Role of Press in the Dynamics of Social Movements." *Research in Social Movements, Conflicts, and Change*, 9:71-96.
- Klandermans, Bert. 1984. "Mobilization and Participation: Social-Psychological Expansion of Resource Mobilization Theory." *American Sociological Review* 49(5): 583-600.
- Klandermans, Bert and Dirk Oegema. 1987. "Potentials, Networks, Motivations, and Barriers: Steps towards Participation in Social Movements." *American Sociological Review* 52: 519-531.
- Klandermans, Bert. 1988. "The Formation and Mobilization of Consensus." *International Social Movement Research*, 1: 173-196.

- Klandermans, Bert. 1992. "The Social Construction of Protest and Multiorganizational Fields." Pp. 77-103 in *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*, edited by A. Morris and C. Muller. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Klandermans, Bert. 1997. *The Social Psychology of Protest*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Koopmans, Ruud. 2004. "Movements and media: Selection processes and evolutionary dynamics in the public sphere" *Theory and Society* 22: 367-391.
- Lee, Chin-Chuan. 2003. "Liberalization without Full Democracy: Guerrilla Media and Political Movements in Taiwan." Pp. 163-175 in *Contesting Media Power: Alternative Media in A Networked World*, edited by Nick Couldry and James Curran. Oxford, UK: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, INC.
- Lee, Hsiao-ching. 2008. *The Rhetorical Vision of Anti-Corruption and Anti-Chen Movement in the Media: A case study of The United Daily News and China Times*. Unpublished Master thesis, Shih Hsin University.
- Mazur, Allan. 1988. "Mass Media Effects on Public Opinion about Nuclear Power Plants." Unpublished manuscript. Syracuse University, Department of Sociology.
- McAdam, Doug. 1982. *The political process and the development of black insurgency*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- McAdam, Dough, John D. McCarthy and Mayer Zald, ed. 1996. *Comparative Perspectives on Social Movements: Political Opportunities, Mobilizing Structures and Social Framings*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- McCarthy, John D. and Mayer Zald. 1996. "Introduction: Opportunities, Mobilizing Structure, and Framing processes – Toward a Synthetic, Comparative Perspective on Social Movements." Pp. 1-20 in *Comparative Perspectives on Social Movements: Political Opportunities, Mobilizing Structures and Social Framings*, edited by D. McAdam, John D. McCarthy and Mayer Zald. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- "Media Watch." 2006. World Almanac Education Group. Retrieved February 2, 2010

- (<http://goliath.ecnext.com/coms2/product-compint-0000737003-page.html>)
- Peng, Yua. 2006. "Soft News and Political Knowledge with Civic Values." National Chengchi University. Retrieved March 13, 2010 (<http://140.119.115.26/bitstream/140.119/3690/1/932412H004015SSS.pdf>).
- Piven, Frances F. and Richard A. Cloward. 1979. *Poor People's Movements: Why They Succeed, How They Fail*. NY: Vintage Books.
- "Press Freedom Index 2006." 2006. Reporters Without Borders. Retrieved February 2, 2010 (<http://en.rsf.org/press-freedom-index-2006,35.html>).
- Riffe, Daniel, Stephen Lacy, and Federick G. Fico. 1998. *Analyzing Media Message: Using Quantitative Content Analysis in Research*. Mahwah, NJ/ London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Ross, Lee D. 1977. "The Intuitive Psychologist and His Shortcoming: Distortions in the Attribution Process." *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology*, 10: 173-220.
- Scheufele, Dietram. 1999. "Framing as a Theory of Media Effects." *Journal of Communication*, 49(1): 103-122.
- Shih, Fang-long. 2007. "The 'Red' Tide Anti-Corruption Protest: What Does it Mean for Democracy in Taiwan?" *Taiwan in Comparative perspective* 1: 87-98.
- Singleton, Royce A. and Jr., Bruce C. Straits. 1999. *Approaches to Social Research*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Snow, David A., E. Burke Rochford, Jr., Steve K. Worden, and Robert D. Benford. 1986. "Frame alignment process, micromobilization and movement participation." *American Sociological Review* 51: 464-481.
- Snow, David A. and Robert D. Benford. 1988. "Ideology, Frame Resonance, and Participant Mobilization." *International Social Movement Research*, 1:197-217.
- "Statistics on Media" 2006. Ministry of Transportation and Communications. Retrieved on February 2, 2010 (<http://www.motc.gov.tw/>).

- The China Post Staff. 2006. "Academics Urge Chen to Quit Over Scandals." *The China Post*, July 14. Retrieved January 20, 2010 (<http://www.chinapost.com.tw/taiwan/detail.asp?ID=85867&GRP=B>)
- Wang, Shu-hua. 2007. *The Sources of Political Knowledge: Focusing on Effects of Education and Mass Media*. Unpublished Master thesis, Tamkang University.
- Wang, T. Y. and G. Andy Chang. 2006. "External Threats and Political Tolerance in Taiwan." *Political Research Quarterly* 59(3): 377-388.
- Wu, Szu-i. 2007. *The Political Economy of the Red-Shirted Movement in Taiwan*. Unpublished Master thesis, National Taiwan University.
- Zald, Mayer N. 1996. "Culture, ideology, and strategic framing." Pp. 261-274 in *Comparative Perspective on Social movements: Political opportunities, mobilizing structures, and cultural framings*, edited by Doug McAdam, John McCarthy, and Mayer Zald. Cambridge/ New York: Cambridge University Press.

BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

Wen-hsin Ho received her Bachelor of Arts in Political Science in July, 2005 from National Cheng-kung University in Taiwan. She will receive a Master of Arts in Sociology in August, 2010 from University of Texas at Arlington. During her graduate studies, she served as a Graduate Teaching Assistant in Fall semester, 2009 and Spring semester, 2010. Her research interests are social movements and social statistics.